## **First Direct Image of a Black Hole**

Paul Ho, EAO/ASIAA

### **BLACK HOLE SHADOW: APRIL 10, 2019**



### Why is This Result Important? because it's not theory !

- Black Hole: "INVISIBLE" or "UNSEEABLE"
- Black Hole: where "GRAVITY" is strongest
- Black Hole: no escape not even light
- Black Hole: no information from inside
- Small Black Hole: "end state" of big stars (>5-10 times sun)
   leftover after "supernova" explosion
- Big Black Hole: Billions times the sun's mass in the nucleus of galaxies
- Black Hole Properties: high temperature? high density? depends on mass of Black Hole
- Black Hole Physics: tests General Relativity
- This Experiment is an "Optics" + "Information" Problem

## **Some Very Simple Physics**

- Light: Energy ~ v ~ 1/λ Energy ~ Temperature
- Speed of Light constant:  $c = 3 \times 10^{10} cm/s$
- Apparent Size ~ 1 / Distance
- Doppler Motion: Like Train Whistle:  $\Delta v = (\Delta \text{Velocity / c}) v_0$
- Total Energy Conserved
- Angular Momentum (MVR) Conserved :  $V \sim 1 / R$
- Special Relativity; General Relativity





(wikipedia: F.K. Hwang)



### **Signature of Doppler Motions**



## **Gravity affects Geometry of Space**



- Mass will distort space-time until even light cannot escape
- Einstein predicted the existence of black holes - though even he was not comfortable with the conclusions from his equations



**Gravity/Geometry instead of Material/Dielectric to bend Light** 

## Shadow comes from General Relativity Shadow Diameter ~ 5.2 R<sub>sch</sub>







### **No Escape From Black Hole ?**

 $V_{escape} < c$ 

 $E = \gamma mc^2$ 

- $V_{escape} = (2GM/r)^{1/2}$
- $r = 2GM / (V_{escape})^2$
- Schwarzchild Radius:  $R_{sch} = 2GM / c^2$

 $ds^{2} = (1 - 2GM/c^{2}r) c^{2}dt^{2} - dr^{2}/(1 - 2GM/c^{2}r) - r^{2}d\theta^{2} - r^{2}\sin^{2}\theta d\phi^{2}$ 

- Special Relativity tells us Energy becomes Infinite as velocity approaches the speed of light therefore no escape!
- General Relativity tells us even Light must follow the distorted geometry from Gravity therefore "bent" light rays!

### What is Physics like inside Black Hole?

- Physics depends on density and temperature
- Black Hole defined by  $M / R = c^2 / 2G \sim 6.7 \times 10^{27} \text{ g/cm}$
- Density ~  $M / R^3$  not M / R
- earth size black hole ~ 6 x  $10^{27}$  g ~ 1 cm ;  $10^{27}$  times water density
- sun size black hole ~ 2 x  $10^{33}$  g ~ 300 km;  $10^{11}$  times water density
- M87 black hole ~  $1 \times 10^{43}$  g ~ 130 AU;  $10^{-3}$  water density

### **Really Big Black Holes may be "Ordinary"**

### Recent BLACK HOLE Research — Hear it, Feel it, (Not) See it

- Detection of Gravitational Waves (tens of cases)
- Progenitors of Gravitational Waves (one +)
- Orbital Motions at the Event Horizon (one)
- Imaging of the Event Horizon (two)
- GR Effects
- common technique: Interferometry (optics and missing information problem)

Paul Ho, ASIAA/EAO

# LIGO 'HEARD' GW

The LIGO experiment (another interferometer) was designed to be sensitive to the very ripples in space caused by gravitational disturbances

Like two black holes colliding...

### **GW Detectors: LIGO, VIRGO, KAGRA**



### **Signatures of Gravitational Waves**



## **More Examples**

**GRAVITATIONAL-WAVE TRANSIENT CATALOG-1** 



## Where is GW091415: LMC?



### TIME DELAYS

Detection at : LIGO at Livingston followed by 7 x 10<sup>-3</sup> sec LIGO at Hanford

positioning will improve with VIRGO and KAGRA

### Subaru Hyper Suprime Cam Project Target Dark Matter and Dark Energy



Galaxy Cluster Abell 2218 NASA, A. Fruchter and the ERO Team (STScl, ST-ECF) • STScl-PRC00-08

1.5 degree FOV, 10 x FOV (Surpime Camera)
40 M USD Budget (Taiwan 5M), 5 year timescale
ASIAA: Filter Exchanger, CCD and Lens Testing
Weak Lensing Tomography; z>6

- ASIAA delivered 2011
- HSC on Subaru 02.12
- HSC commission 08.12
- HSC survey papers 2018



raw image of M31



**HSC Integrated on Subaru** 

# Widest 3D dark matter map ever



Miyazaki et al. 2018

Growth of the structure clearly visible for the first time.



Only Subaru can create this, for now.



# Subaru optical-infrared follow-up of the binary neutron star merger GW170817

2017.08.24-25

2017.08.18-19



HSC: z-band, IRSF: H, Ks-bands

Subaru HSC & MOIRCS succeeded to get the optical – near-infrared light from a binary neutron star merger event GW170817.

Ustumi et al. 2017



We surveyed ~70% of the 90% credible area of the localization skymap of GW170817 with HSC. → The OT at NGC4993 is the most promising candidate for the optical counterpart of GW170817

Tominaga et al. 2017

### Kilonova models and the OT of GW170817





The optical – NIR light curves and SED variation are well reproduced by the kilonova models  $\rightarrow$  The site of the cosmic *r*-process was observationally identified!



# **Future GW Research**

- Expanded Sensitivity and New Instruments (Einstein Telescope, Cosmic Explorer, LISA)
- Many more detections, plus SMBHBs?
- Inspiral phase and post merger phase
- Theoretical Tests for GR effects

# **GRAVITY** can be "FELT"

- The movement of stars accelerated to a fraction of the speed of light around an invisible object - showed SgrA\* is likely a supermassive black hole at the center of our galaxy
- Keck telescopes and GRAVITY (VLT) have tracked them over 20 years (Andrea Ghez, Reinhard Genzel)





### **Working Principle of "Gravity"**



- Guide Star for Adaptive Optics (atmospheric seeing)
- Fringe Tracking Star for Phase (interferometer baselines)
- VLTI for Interferometry (high angular resolution)
- 6 baselines; 3 x 10<sup>-3</sup> " resolution; ~40 x 10<sup>-6</sup> " astrometry



### Stars in Orbit around SgrA\* 26 years of observations of S2



GRAVITY collaboration+18a, A&A 615, L10

### **Orbit of S2 relative to SgrA\***



### **Motion of S2 shows GR Redshift**





## Hot SPOT in ORBIT at ISCO

### Detection of orbital motions near SgrA\*s ISCO

#### July 22<sup>nd</sup>, 2018



Broderick & Loeb 2006, Hamaus et al. 2009 *GRAVITY collaboration 2018b, A&A 618, L10* 

# **Future Research of ISCO**

- Next Generation ISCO experiments
- extremely large telescope projects such as TMT, ELT, GMT, can provide better precision
- more accurate measurements of orbits
- fainter targets for orbital tests
- gas infall events detectable

### Ionized Gas Gloud G2 near SgrA\*



G2 orbit in Red approaching SgrA\*

Gillenssen et al. 2012

### Ionized Gas Gloud G2 near SgrA\* Position-Velocity Diagrams



```
Br-y and He-I 2µm lines
```

Gillessen et al. 2019: SINFONI

### **Gas Inflow to SgrA\***

- G2 does not hit SgrA\*
- G2 traverses some ISM which provides drag
- G2 is not a singular event, has another clump following
- Where does G2 come from?
- We pull back to look at the surrounding ISM

## **GRAVITY can be "SEEN" ? Take a Picture of Black Hole ?**

- M87 black hole ~  $1 \times 10^{43} \text{ g} \sim 130 \text{ AU}$
- But M87 is very far! 53 Million Light Years
   5 x 10<sup>20</sup> km from us
- Schwarzschild Radius ~ 10 micro arcsecond Sun or Moon ~ 30 arc minutes

M87 black hole ~  $5 \times 10^{-9}$  size of moon

### Directly Resolving the Black Hole "because Seeing is Believing"

- Target Supermassive Black Hole
- Nearest Examples (SgrA\*, M87)

(Shadow: ~5R<sub>sch</sub> ~40 x 10<sup>-6</sup>")

• Very Long Baseline Interferometry at Submm Wavelength

<u>Precision</u>  $\sim 10^{-10}$
# **Problem is Size**

- The problem is nearby black holes are too small, and supermassive black holes are too far. Existing telescopes cannot resolve them.
- Two cases that look biggest to us would be at the center of our galaxy... and one in M87 1000 times further away, but also 1000 times bigger.
- The expected shadow around the black hole is just 50 μas
- We Need a telescope the size of the earth:

 $\theta_{array} = \lambda/D = 1.3$ mm/11000 km ~ 20 µas

#### **DIFFRACTION PROBLEM**





#### JCMT is an EAO Initiative

- Atacama Large Millimeter Array (ALMA), Chile
- ALMA Pathfinder Experiment (APEX), Chile
- James Clerk Maxwell Telescope (JCMT), Hawaii
- Large Millimeter Telescope (LMT), Mexico
- IRAM 30-meter Telescope, Spain
- South Pole Telescope (SPT), South Pole
- Submillimeter Array (SMA), Hawaii
- Submillimeter Telescope (SMT), Arizona



### **Event Horizon Telescope in 2017**

### **East Asian Observatory**

- History of Development: Established 2014
- Model: Asian Counterpart to ESO
- EAO Members: NAOC, NAOJ, KASI, ASIAA
- Goals and Aspirations: Looking to the Future
- Current Status: Operating JCMT, Access SMA, Access UKIRT
- Current Plans: Access more Facilities (Subaru), Construct Next Generation Instruments
- Future Plans: Expand EAO Members

   (Observer: Vietnam, Thailand, Malaysia, Indonesia)
   other Southeast Asian regions and India ?
   Observer Status: Access EAO Facilities
   Thailand will soon become Partner in EAO

### **Very Long Baseline Interferometer**

- Simulate a Very Large Telescope (Intercontinental Distance)
- Link Telescopes by synchronizing Wave Front
- Precision at 1/20 wavelength (40µm), over ~10,000 km
  - distance between telescopes
  - arrival of wavefront at each telescope
  - compensate for differential atmospheric effects
  - compensate for differential electronics effects
  - compensate for individual telescope response
  - correct for sparsely sampled telescope surface
- VLBI is one of Nobel Prizes in Radio Astronomy (Ryle and Hewish 1974) — <u>IMAGE RECONSTRUCTION</u>

### **Center of the Galaxy (radio)**







# VLBI (2014): Imaging SgrA\*











#### M87 (M 87 - NGC 4486)

#### Type: Galaxy

#### Magnitude: 8.60

100µas

RA/DE (J2000): 12h30m48.0s/+12°24'00.0" RA/DE (of date): 12h30m54s/+12°23'22" Hour angle/DE: 19h19m8s/+12°23'22" (geometric) Hour angle/DE: 19h19m14s/+12°24'58" (apparent) Az/Alt: +96°41'29"/+22°16'38" (geometric) Az/Alt: +96°41'29"/+22°18'47" (apparent) Size: +0°07'12"

e inpressioni

Image Credit: Bill Saxton NRAO/AUI/NSF

Walker et al (2008)

VLBA 43 GHz

#### Case of M87



60" Elliptical Galaxy M87 Hubble IASA, ESA, and the Hubble Heritage Team (STScI/AURA) • Hubble Space Telescope ACS • STScI-PRC-08-30b



-5 RA Offset (mas)

10mas





#### Case of M87: HST and VLBA data





#### HST Spectroscopy Yields Mass

Macchetto+ 1997

Gebhardt & Thomas 2009

**Distance: 16 Mpc** 

Mass: 3.2 (6.4)  $\times 10^9$  M<sub>o</sub>

**ν** r<sub>g</sub> = 2 (4) μas

VLBA Imaging Yields Jet Walker et al 2008

SMBH: Source of Jet Accretion Disk: Shadow

Shadow ~ 20 (40)µas

### **Collimation and Acceleration of M 87 Jet**

#### Asada, K. et al. 2014, ApJL, 781, 2

Asada & Nakamura 2012, ApJ, 745, 28 Nakamura & Asada 2013, ApJ, 775, 118



α: power-law index of streamline (= 1.7)

Komissarov et al. 2009 MNRAS, 394, 1182

In non- relativistic

In relativistic regime,

 $V_z \propto Z^{2/\alpha}$ 

 $\Gamma \propto \mathbf{Z} \, (\alpha - 1)/\alpha$ 

Nakamura & Asada 2013, ApJ, 775, 118

# Mass Accretion onto M87 BH



$$\dot{M} = 1.1 \times 10^{-8} \left[ 1 - (r_{\rm out}/r_{\rm in})^{-(3\beta-1)/2} \right]^{-2/3} \times \left( \frac{M_{\bullet}}{6.6 \times 10^9 M_{\odot}} \right)^{4/3} \left( \frac{2}{3\beta - 1} \right)^{-2/3} r_{\rm in}^{7/6} R M^{2/3}$$

 $\dot{M} = 9.2 \times 10^{-4} M_{\odot} \text{ yr}^{-1} = 7.4 \times 10^{-3} M_{Bondi}$ 

⇒ Mass accretion is significantly suppressed while material is accreted from Bondi radius to a few 10 r<sub>s</sub>.

### **Submm VLBI Science Objectives**

1. Direct proof of the existence of the SMBH

- 2. Imaging the shadow = measuring the Metric !!
  - Test for General Relativity in the strong field
  - Mass, Spin of the BH
- **3. Astrophysics related to the SMBH** 
  - -Accretion process onto the SMBH
  - Formation process of the jets



0.1 arc second resolution



#### **Appearance of the shadow of the SMBH**

Size = Msss Shape = Spin + Geometry

In optically thin flow and spherical geometry line of the spherical sphe	Geometry / Spin	No rotating BH	Maximum rotating BH
In optically thick flow and geometrically thin disk	In optically thin flow and spherical geometry		
	In optically thick flow and geometrically thin disk		

# **Image simulation of M87**



Model image with a 6 x 10<sup>9</sup> Mo SMBH and optically thin accreting matter, derived by the Ray Tracing method.

Observed image simulation with the submm VLBI at 345 GHz.

# **Imaging Simulation of M87**





#### **Event Horizon Telescope**



#### VLBI Experiment April 6, 2017







#### **Event Horizon Telescope**



**Aperture Synthesis: Building up UV Coverage Visibility = Sampling · Source + Error**  Event Horizon Telescope

# **Removing "Errors"**



Blazar OJ 287; Hawaii-Spain (SMA-IRAM) baseline 420-second integration

Ad-hoc phasing with ALMA corrects for atmospheric fluctuations and allows for strong detections in short time intervals on very long baselines.

### **Phase Referencing with ALMA**



# **Removing "Defects"**

#### Imaging of M87



2019 May 14th, NTU

UV-weighting, Clean, Phase Self-Calibrate, Amplitude Self-Calibrate

# **Calibration and Imaging**



# Variability?

- Large Scale:
   —— slight difference
- Small Scale:
  - —— STABLE
- Longest Baselines:
   Probe Horizon



#### EHT + ALMA proposal in 2016





Event Horizon Telescope

2019 May 8th, NCU

# What does the Image Say?



### It's Black, and Looks like a Hole

## **Physical Parameters?**

- Photon Ring: ~42µas or ~400au, round
- Schwarzschild radius:  $r_s = 2 \text{ GM} / c^2$
- Shadow Size ~5 times r<sub>s</sub> (Event Horizon radius)
  - as expected by General Relativity
  - **——** deduced mass ~ 6.5 billion solar mass
- Ring Brightness:  $n_e \sim 10^4 \text{ cm}^{-3}$ ,  $B \sim 3G$ ,  $M_{accr} \sim 10^{-3} M_{sun} \text{ yr}^{-1}$
- Ring Asymmetry: Brighter on Bottom Side
   consistent with rotation with doppler boosting
- Tipped Disk: Perpendicular to Relativistic Jet
- Spin of Black Hole: Pointed away from Earth

#### **Doppler Boosting of Approaching Part of Rotating Ring**



#### **Inner Rotation must lock to Black Hole Rotation**

#### **Simulation of Doppler Boosting**

+1759.3 days 40 -4020 -20 y  $[\mu as]$  $[\mu as]$ 0 -0 -S -20 --20 --40 --40 --40-2020 0 40 x  $[\mu as]$ 

+1759.3 days



G. Wong, B. Prather, C. Gammie (Illinois)

# Observation





### Summary

- Current Research depends on Angular Resolution
- Gravity Wave Research probes Coalescence Process in building larger Black Holes
- Optical/IR Interferometry probes dynamics at Event Horizon and test GR effects
- Submm Very Long Baseline Interferometry probes structures of Event Horizon and physical processes and test GR effects
- Next Generation Instruments will have more resolution and more sensitivity (time domain, energy domain, dynamics domain)
- Asia will play a leading role in this Frontier in Optics!

#### Where are the Problems?

- Resolution still limited (only 2 targets: M87, SgrA\*)
- Resolution can be improved by factor of 10
- How to look at "milliparsec" problem (merging black hole binaries at what scale?)
- How to measure rotation/spin
- How to do the astrophysics (jet launching, accretion disk)
- How to use the black hole to probe other phenomena
- what should we do next?

# What is Next?

**Higher frequency = better resolution** 

More sensitive instruments - Namakanui!

More stations - Greenland telescope

**Polarization measurements** 

Milky Way black hole...

Merging SMBHs?

**ASIA will have Increasing Impacts** 

## **The Event Horizon Telescope in 2018**





# The Largest Telescope Ever: Greenland Telescope leverages SMA and ALMA and JCMT

Greenland Telescope





Aim: LOW PMV Sensitivity: ALMA Surface Area

### **The Greenland Telescope Project**



### **Starting The GLT Project**

- Recover ALMA-Taiwan Investment
- Extend ALMA Capabilities
- Recover ALMA Proto-Type Antenna
- Leverage ALMA Collecting Area
- Attain Highest Angular Resolution

   shortest λ, longest BL
- VLBI Imaging instead of Fringe Fitting
- ALMA-Taiwan approved in 2008
- GLT Project began in 2009

### Arrival in Greenland 07.16.16







#### Assembly of Antenna Mount 09.10.16


## Fully Assembled Telescope 08.2017





### **TARGET: SUMMIT STATION GREENLAND**

#### N 72.5, W 38.5, altitude: 3200 m







# **Future in EHT Science**

• Move GLT to Summit in 2021-2022

- Need: Establish Base at Summit
- Need: Housing, Power
- Need: Transport to Summit
- Need: Construction at Summit
- Need: Winter-over Operations





## **Final Remarks**

- BH Image made the "expectations" REAL
- Resonance with the Public: Seeing the "un-seeable"
- Resonance in Asia: We can work at the Forefront
- Importance: Measure BH Properties Directly
- Importance: Test General Relativity at Extreme Gravity
- Problem: Compete Internationally for Credit
- Problem: Generate Support within Asia
- Present: Asia is Partner on 4 of 9 EHT facilities
- Future: Asia to Lead at Highest Frequencies, Highest Resolution

## **Denmark in the EHT/GLT**

Visits to Denmark: 10.2014, 11.2015, 02.2019, 04.2019

- Integration and Cooperation with existing and future Danish projects at Greenland Summit; Collaboration with Greenlanders
- Joint Development of 1<sup>st</sup> Arctic Observatory
- 1. Site development and support infrastructures: energy generation
- 2. Platform for future experiments and projects: arctic investigation station
- 3. Development of future observatories: planning and studies
- Partner on the GLT Project
- 1. Science on the GLT: VLBI, THz science, theory
- 2. Deployment and Commissioning of GLT: construction and testing
- 3. Engineering Aspects of GLT: hardware, construction
- 4. Staffing: faculty, postdocs, graduate students, interns
- 5. Operations: site support, administration, engineering
- 6. Politics: interface with Denmark and Greenland government agencies