Symbol Alphabet from Plabic Graphs and Tensor Diagrams

Anastasia Volovich Brown University

Mago, Ren, Schreiber, Spradlin, Yelleshpur Srikant 2007.00646, 2012.15812, 2106.01405, 2106.01406











Introduction

- Planar N=4 Yang-Mills scattering amplitudes have been computed to very high loop order.
- They have many remarkable properties, that have sparked interest from mathematicians working on combinatorics, algebraic geometry and number theory.
- At the same time, several methods that have been developed for N=4 Yang-Mills are directly applicable to, and have greatly aided, QCD computations.
- In this talk, I will review some recent developments in N=4 Yang-Mills amplitudes and describe some approaches that hope to explain their properties using various mathematical constructions.

Outline

- Introduction
- Status and tools for amplitudes computations
- 6 and 7-point amplitudes: cluster algebras
- 8 and 9-point amplitudes: new features
- Symbol alphabet from plabic graphs
- Symbol alphabet from tensor diagrams
- Conclusions

Status: n-point amplitudes in N=4 planar Yang-Mills

- n<6 all loops Bern, Dixon, Smirnov '05
- n=6 through 7-loops
- n=7 through 4-loops

Caron-Huot, Dixon, Drummond, Dulat, Foster, Gurdogan, von Hippel, McLeod, Papathanasiou, review: 2005.06735

- n=8 MHV through 3-loop Li, Zhang [to appear: poster session]
- n=8, 9 MHV, NMHV through 2-loops He, Li, Zhang '19'20
- All n MHV through 2-loops Caron-Huot '11

Method: Amplitudes Bootstrap

Write down the answer as linear combo of functions and determine the coefficients by solving a system of linear constraints.

Remaining number of parameters in the ansatz for (MHV, NMHV) n=6 amplitude after each constrain is applied at each loop order:



[Caron-Huot, Dixon, Drummond, Dulat, Foster, Gurdogan, von Hippel, McLeod, Papathanasiou 2005.06735]

Constraint	L = 1	L = 2	L = 3	L = 4	L = 5	L = 6
1. \mathscr{H}_6	6	27	105	372	1214	3692?
2. Symmetry	(2,4)	(7,16)	(22,56)	(66,190)	(197,602)	(567,1795?)
3. Final-entry	(1,1)	(4,3)	(11,6)	(30,16)	(85,39)	(236,102)
4. Collinear	(0,0)	(0,0)	$(0^*, 0^*)$	$(0^*, 2^*)$	$(1^{*3}, 5^{*3})$	$(6^{*2}, 17^{*2})$
5. LL MRK	(0,0)	(0,0)	(0,0)	(0,0)	$(0^*,0^*)$	$(1^{*2}, 2^{*2})$
6. NLL MRK	(0,0)	(0,0)	(0,0)	(0,0)	$(0^*,0^*)$	$(1^*, 0^{*2})$
7. NNLL MRK	(0,0)	(0,0)	(0,0)	(0,0)	(0,0)	$(1, 0^*)$
8. N ³ LL MRK	(0,0)	(0,0)	(0,0)	(0,0)	(0,0)	(1,0)
9. Full MRK	(0,0)	(0,0)	(0,0)	(0,0)	(0,0)	(1,0)
10. T^1 OPE	(0,0)	(0,0)	(0,0)	(0,0)	(0,0)	(1,0)
11. T^2 OPE	(0,0)	(0,0)	(0,0)	(0,0)	(0,0)	(0,0)

Tools: Momentum Twistors

Momentum -> Momentum Twistors

 $\mathbf{Z_i^A} = (\mathbf{Z_i^1}, \mathbf{Z_i^2}, \mathbf{Z_i^3}, \mathbf{Z_i^4}) \in \mathbf{P^3}$

 $\langle ijkl \rangle \equiv \langle Z_i Z_j Z_k Z_l \rangle = \det(Z_i Z_j Z_k Z_l)$



Penrose, Hodges, Arkani-Hamed et al

Tools: Symbol Alphabet

"Dogma": MHV and NHMV L-loop amplitudes can be expressed in terms of multiple polylogarithms of weight m=2L

$$dF_m = \sum_{\phi_{\alpha_1} \in \Phi} F_{m-1}^{\phi_{\alpha_1}} d\log \phi_{\alpha_1}$$

$$dF_{m-1}^{\phi_{\alpha_1}} = \sum_{\phi_{\alpha_2} \in \Phi} F_{m-2}^{\phi_{\alpha_2},\phi_{\alpha_1}} d\log \phi_{\alpha_2}$$

SYMBOL

$$\mathbf{S}[F_m] = \sum_{\phi_{\alpha_1}, \phi_{\alpha_2}, \dots, \phi_{\alpha_m} \in \Phi} F_0^{\phi_{\alpha_m}, \phi_{\alpha_{m-1}}, \dots, \phi_{\alpha_2}\phi_{\alpha_1}} [\phi_{\alpha_m} \otimes \phi_{\alpha_{m-1}} \otimes \dots \otimes \phi_{\alpha_2} \otimes \phi_{\alpha_1}]$$

 $\phi_{\alpha} \in \Phi$

$$dLi_2(z) = -\log(1-z)d\log(z) \rightarrow \mathbf{S}[Li_2(z)] = -(1-z) \otimes z$$

SYMBOL ALPHABET

Goncharov, Spradlin, Vergu, AV

n=6 symbol alphabet is given by 15 letters [9 DCI ratios]

all Gr(4,6) Plucker coordinates <a a+1 b c>

$$R_6^{(2)} = \operatorname{Li}_4\left(-\frac{\langle 1234\rangle\langle 2356\rangle}{\langle 1236\rangle\langle 2345\rangle}\right) - \frac{1}{4}\operatorname{Li}_4\left(-\frac{\langle 1246\rangle\langle 1345\rangle}{\langle 1234\rangle\langle 1456\rangle}\right) + \cdots$$

Del Duca, Duhr, Smirnov; Goncharov Spradlin Vergu AV

n=7 symbol alphabet is given by 49 letters [42 DCI ratios]

all Gr(4,7) Plucker coordinates <a a+1 b c> 7 cyclic images <1(23)(45)(67)> and <1(27)(34)(56)>

$$R_{7}^{(2)} = \frac{1}{4} \operatorname{Li}_{2,2} \left(\frac{\langle 1267 \rangle \langle 2345 \rangle}{\langle 1237 \rangle \langle 2456 \rangle}, -\frac{\langle 2456 \rangle \langle 1(23)(45)(67) \rangle}{\langle 1267 \rangle \langle 1456 \rangle \langle 2345 \rangle} \right) - \frac{1}{2} \operatorname{Li}_{2,2} \left(\frac{\langle 1267 \rangle \langle 1345 \rangle}{\langle 1234 \rangle \langle 1567 \rangle}, \frac{\langle 1(27)(34)(56) \rangle}{\langle 1267 \rangle \langle 1345 \rangle} \right) + \cdots$$

 $\langle a(bc)(de)(fg)\rangle \equiv \langle abde \rangle \langle acfg \rangle - \langle abfg \rangle \langle acde \rangle$

Caron-Huot; Golden Goncharov Spradlin Vergu AV

180 RATIONAL LETTERS

He, Li, Zhang '19

- 68 Plücker coordinates of the form $\langle a \ a+1 \ b \ c \rangle$,
- 8 cyclic images of $\langle 12\bar{4} \cap \bar{7} \rangle$,
- 40 cyclic images of $\langle 1(23)(45)(78) \rangle$, $\langle 1(23)(56)(78) \rangle$, $\langle 1(28)(34)(56) \rangle$, $\langle 1(28)(34)(67) \rangle$, $\langle 1(28)(45)(67) \rangle$,
- 48 dihedral images of $\langle 1(23)(45)(67) \rangle$, $\langle 1(23)(45)(68) \rangle$, $\langle 1(28)(34)(57) \rangle$,
- 8 cyclic images of $\langle \bar{2} \cap (245) \cap \bar{8} \cap (856) \rangle$,
- and 8 distinct dihedral images of $\langle \bar{2} \cap (245) \cap \bar{6} \cap (681) \rangle$.

 $\bar{a} \equiv (a-1 \ a \ a+1)$ $\langle ab(cde) \cap (fgh) \rangle = \langle acde \rangle \langle bfgh \rangle - \langle bcde \rangle \langle afgh \rangle$ $\langle \bar{x} \cap (abc) \cap \bar{y} \cap (def) \rangle \equiv \langle a, (bc) \cap \bar{x}, d, (ef) \cap \bar{y} \rangle$ $\langle a, b, c, (de) \cap (fgh) \rangle \equiv \langle abcd \rangle \langle efgh \rangle - \langle abce \rangle \langle dfgh \rangle$

2 x 9 ALGEBRAIC LETTERS (SQUARE ROOTS)

 $\Delta_{1357} = (\langle 1256 \rangle \langle 3478 \rangle - \langle 1278 \rangle \langle 3456 \rangle - \langle 1234 \rangle \langle 5678 \rangle)^2 - 4 \langle 1234 \rangle \langle 3456 \rangle \langle 5678 \rangle \langle 1278 \rangle \qquad \text{and 1 cyclic}$

180 RATIONAL LETTERS

He, Li, Zhang '19

- 68 Plücker coordinates of the form $\langle a \ a+1 \ b \ c \rangle$,
- 8 cyclic images of $\langle 12\bar{4} \cap \bar{7} \rangle$,
- 40 cyclic images of $\langle 1(23)(45)(78) \rangle$, $\langle 1(23)(56)(78) \rangle$, $\langle 1(28)(34)(56) \rangle$, $\langle 1(28)(34)(67) \rangle$, $\langle 1(28)(45)(67) \rangle$,
- 48 dihedral images of $\langle 1(23)(45)(67) \rangle$, $\langle 1(23)(45)(68) \rangle$, $\langle 1(28)(34)(57) \rangle$,
- 8 cyclic images of $\langle \bar{2} \cap (245) \cap \bar{8} \cap (856) \rangle$,
- and 8 distinct dihedral images of $\langle \bar{2} \cap (245) \cap \bar{6} \cap (681) \rangle$.

Additional 24 letters were very recently found for 3-loop MHV

 $\langle 1(23)(46)(78) \rangle$, $\langle \overline{2} \cap \overline{4} \cap (568) \cap \overline{8} \rangle$ and $\langle \overline{2} \cap \overline{4} \cap \overline{6} \cap (681) \rangle$

2 x 9 ALGEBRAIC LETTERS (SQUARE ROOTS)

Li, Zhang [to appear: poster session]

```
\Delta_{1357} = (\langle 1256 \rangle \langle 3478 \rangle - \langle 1278 \rangle \langle 3456 \rangle - \langle 1234 \rangle \langle 5678 \rangle)^2 - 4 \langle 1234 \rangle \langle 3456 \rangle \langle 5678 \rangle \langle 1278 \rangle \qquad \text{and 1 cyclic}
```

He, Li, Zhang '20

59 x 9 RATIONAL LETTERS

- 13 cyclic classes of $\langle 12kl \rangle$ for $3 \le k < l \le 8$ but $(k, l) \ne (6, 7), (7, 8);$
- 7 cyclic classes of $\langle 12(ijk) \cap (lmn) \rangle$ for $3 \le i < j < k < l < m < n \le 9$;
- 8 cyclic classes of $\langle \overline{2} \cap (245) \cap \overline{6} \cap (691) \rangle$, $\langle \overline{2} \cap (346) \cap \overline{6} \cap (892) \rangle$, $\langle \overline{2} \cap (346) \cap \overline{2} \cap (782) \rangle$, $\langle \overline{2} \cap (245) \cap \overline{7} \cap (791) \rangle$, $\langle \overline{2} \cap (245) \cap (568) \cap \overline{8} \rangle$, $\langle \overline{2} \cap (245) \cap (569) \cap \overline{9} \rangle$, $\langle \overline{2} \cap (245) \cap (679) \cap \overline{9} \rangle$, $\langle \overline{2} \cap (245) \cap (679) \cap \overline{9} \rangle$;
- 10 cyclic classes of (1(i i+1)(j j+1)(k k+1)) for $2 \le i, i+1 < j, j+1 < k \le 8$;
- 6 cyclic classes $\langle 1(2i)(jj+1)(k9) \rangle$ for $3 \le i < j, j+1 < k \le 8$, but $(i,k) \ne (3,8), (4,7);$
- 14 cyclic classes of $\langle 1(29)(ij)(k\,k+1) \rangle$ for $3 < i < j \le 8, \ 3 \le k \le i-2$ or $j+1 \le k \le 7;$
- 1 cyclic class of $\langle 1, (56) \cap \overline{3}, (78) \cap \overline{3}, 9 \rangle$.

11 x 9 ALGEBRAIC LETTERS (SQUARE ROOTS)

 $\Delta_{1357} = (\langle 1256 \rangle \langle 3478 \rangle - \langle 1278 \rangle \langle 3456 \rangle - \langle 1234 \rangle \langle 5678 \rangle)^2 - 4 \langle 1234 \rangle \langle 3456 \rangle \langle 5678 \rangle \langle 1278 \rangle$ and 8 cyclic

So far I told you about the results of amplitude calculations. Is there an independent mathematical description of symbol letters?

So far I told you about the results of amplitude calculations. Is there an independent mathematical description of symbol letters? Yes: Cluster Algebras. We observed that symbol alphabets are given by subsets of cluster coordinates of Grassmannian Cluster Algebra

Gr(4, n)

Golden, Goncharov, Spradlin, Vergu, AV



Fomin, Zelevinsky '02; Scott; Gekhtman, Shapiro, Vainshtein Cluster Algebra Portal: http://www.math.lsa.umich.edu/~fomin/cluster.html

Cluster Coordinates:n=6 and n=7



Matches symbol alphabets for n=6, 7 amplitudes!

Caron-Huot; Golden, Goncharov, Spradlin, Vergu, AV

New Features at n>7

• Gr(4,n) cluster algebra is infinite for n>7

Fomin, Zelevinsky

• Symbol letters involve square roots

He, Li, Zhang

New Features at n>7

- Gr(4,n) cluster algebra is infinite for n>7
- Symbol letters involve square roots
 Is there a mathematical description?
 - 1. Tropical Geometry

Drummond, Foster, Gurdogan, Kalousios '19 Henke, Papathanasiou '19 '21

- 2. Dual Polytopes Arkani-Hamed, Lam, Spradlin '19
- 3. Plabic Graphs Mago, Schreiber, Spradlin, Yelleshpur, AV '20 '21 He Li'20
- 4. Tensor Diagrams Ren, Spradlin, AV '21
- 5. Scattering Diagrams Herderschee '21

1. Tropical Geometry

- Speyer-Williams'03 associated a fan to the positive Grassmanian by solving tropicalized Plucker relations (multiplication->addition, addition->minimum).
- Building on this idea Drummond, Foster, Gurdogan, Kalousios'19 looked at a "smaller" version of Gr(4,8) fan by looking at particular Plucker coordinates.
- This fan has 272 rays that are g-vectors for cluster coordinates that include 180 rational n=8 letters.

 b_2

• There are 2 exceptional rays from which they reproduced 18 algebraic n=8 letters.

2. Dual Polytopes

- Arkani-Hamed, Lam and Spradlin'19 looked at polytopes dual to these fans.
- To compute variables associated to the exceptional rays they used the method of Chang, Duan, Fraser, Li'19 and found evidence for the expected type of square roots.
- They conjectured these variables come from a generating function of the form

 $1 - At + Bt^2$

 $A = \langle 1\,2\,5\,6 \rangle \langle 3\,4\,7\,8 \rangle - \langle 1\,2\,7\,8 \rangle \langle 3\,4\,5\,6 \rangle - \langle 1\,2\,3\,4 \rangle \langle 5\,6\,7\,8 \rangle$ $B = \langle 1\,2\,3\,4 \rangle \langle 3\,4\,5\,6 \rangle \langle 5\,6\,7\,8 \rangle \langle 1\,2\,7\,8 \rangle .$

Poles at $A \pm \sqrt{A^2 - 4B}$

NIMA ARKANI-HAMED JACOB BOURJALLY FREODY CACHAZO ALEXANDER GONCHAROY ALEXANDER POSTNIKOV JAROSLAV TRNKA

GRASSMANNIAN GEOMETRY OF SCATTERING AMPLITUDES



3. Plabic Graphs

The building blocks of N=4 SYM amplitudes are Yangian invariants which are given by integrals

Our Strategy: start with plabic graph, solve C Z=0, compare with known symbol letters.

Mago, Schreiber, Spradlin, Yelleshpur Srikant AV'20 '21 He, Li'20

Example: n=6, k=2



Solution to C Z=0



Letters corresponding to this graph can be summarized by quiver:



 $C = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 & c_{13} & c_{14} & c_{15} & c_{16} \\ 0 & 1 & c_{23} & c_{24} & c_{25} & c_{26} \end{pmatrix}$

 $c_{13} = -f_0 f_1 f_2 f_3 f_4 f_5 f_6$, $c_{23} = f_0 f_1 f_2 f_3 f_4 f_5 f_6 f_8$, $c_{14} = -f_0 f_1 f_2 f_3 f_4 (1+f_6),$ $c_{24} = f_0 f_1 f_2 f_3 f_4 f_6 f_8,$ $c_{15} = -f_0 f_1 f_2 (1 + f_4 + f_4 f_6), \qquad c_{25} = f_0 f_1 f_2 f_4 f_6 f_8,$ $c_{16} = -f_0(1 + f_2 + f_2f_4 + f_2f_4f_6), \quad c_{26} = f_0f_2f_4f_6f_8.$

n=6 and n=7



We exactly reproduce n=6 symbol alphabet



We exactly reproduce n=7 symbol alphabet

Algebraic letters: n=8

This graph gives 8 algebraic letters:





To obtain the 9th: square move on f3. Cycling by one: we reproduce all n=8 algebraic letters.



Rational Letters

- It is not possible to obtain all rational symbol letters from just plabic graphs.
- We have to consider non-plabic C-matrices.



Mutation of face
$$\,f_8\,$$
 gives non-plabic $\,C^\prime$

- In some cases, solutions involve non-cluster coordinates.
- We showed that restricting to the top cell (k=n-4) of the Grassmannian but allowing arbitrary non-plabic Cmatrices, we will always produce cluster variables.

Symbol Alphabet from Plabic Graphs

- We identified set of graphs that reproduced all known n=8 and n=9 symbol alphabets.
- We do not have a theory to explain the pattern of which cells are associated to which symbol letter observed in amplitudes.
- We provided some "phenomenological" data in hope that future work will shed more light on this interesting problem.

4. Tensor Diagrams

Cluster variables can be represented by tensor diagrams Fomin Pilyavsky'16



An *n*-point sl_k tensor diagram is a finite graph drawn inside a circle with *n* marked points along its boundary, satisfying

- all boundary vertices are colored black, and can have arbitrary valence
- each internal vertex may be black or white, but must have valence k
- each edge must connect a black and white vertex

4. Tensor Diagrams

Cluster variables can be represented by tensor diagrams Fomin Pilyavsky'16



To each diagram D one associates an invariant [D] by assigning

- \blacktriangleright a momentum twistor Z_i
- $\blacktriangleright \epsilon^{i_1 \cdots i_k}$ to each white vertex
- \blacktriangleright $\epsilon_{i_1 \cdots i_k}$ to each black vertex

and then contract the indices together as indicated by the edges.

Skein Relations

Tensor invariants [D] are invariant under graphical moves called skein relations.





Fomin-Pylyavsky Conjecture

- A web is a planar tensor diagram.
- An aborizable web is a web that can be turned into a tree diagram using skein relations.



 Fomin-Pilyavsky '16 conjecture: tensor invariants for an arborizable web are in one-to-one correspondence with cluster variables. [Proven by Fraser '17 for Gr(3,9) and Gr(4,8).]

Algebraic Letters from Tensor Diagrams

 We proposed to look at almost aborizable webs (that can be reduced to having one inner loop), and assign to them a "web series"



the coefficients can be derived graphically by twisting the inner loop



• We showed that the series takes the form:

$$\frac{1 - B t^2}{1 - A t + B t^2} \qquad A = \langle 1256 \rangle \langle 3478 \rangle - \langle 1278 \rangle \langle 3456 \rangle - \langle 1234 \rangle \langle 5678 \rangle \\ B = \langle 1234 \rangle \langle 3456 \rangle \langle 5678 \rangle \langle 1278 \rangle .$$

- We observe square roots in the poles: $A \pm \sqrt{A^2 4B}$
- We reproduce square roots up to n=9.



Ren, Spradlin, AV'21

Conclusions

- Symbol Alphabet of N=4 Yang-Mills amplitudes is described by Gr(4,n) cluster algebras for n=6, 7.
- Starting with n=8 one needs a mechanism producing finite subsets in Gr(4,n) and square roots.
- We studied candidate mechanisms coming from plabic graphs and tensor diagrams.
- Future: more systematics, more examples, cluster adjacency, cluster functions, non-SYM.....