Double Copy and Higher-Spin Amplitudes



Henrik Johansson

Uppsala U. & Nordita

Feb 8, 2022



Nordic Winter School on Particle Physics and Cosmology

Based on recent work with: Marco Chiodaroli, Paolo Pichini [2107.14779]

Outline

- Motivation and review of the double copy
- Application to PN calculations
- Scattering amplitudes for Kerr
- EFTs underlying the low-spin Kerr amplitudes
- In the second secon
- Conclusion

Perturbative Einstein gravity (textbook)

$${\cal L}=rac{2}{\kappa^2}\sqrt{g}R,~~g_{\mu
u}=\eta_{\mu
u}+\kappa h_{\mu
u}$$

$$\sum_{\mu_1}^{\nu_1} \sum_{\mu_2}^{\nu_2} = \frac{1}{2} \left[\eta_{\mu_1\nu_1} \eta_{\mu_2\nu_2} + \eta_{\mu_1\nu_2} \eta_{\nu_1\mu_2} - \frac{2}{D-2} \eta_{\mu_1\mu_2} \eta_{\nu_1\nu_2} \right] \frac{i}{p^2 + i\epsilon} \qquad \text{de Donder gauge}$$

$$\begin{split} & \stackrel{k_{2}}{\underset{\mu_{2}}{\overset{\nu_{2}}{\underset{\mu_{3}}{\overset{\mu_{3}}{\underset{\nu_{3}}{\overset{\mu_{3}}{\underset{\nu_{3}}{\overset{\nu_{3}}{\underset{\nu_{3}}{\overset{\mu_{3}}{\underset{\nu_{3}}{\overset{\mu_{3}}{\underset{\nu_{3}}{\overset{\mu_{3}}{\underset{\nu_{3}}{\underset{\nu_{3}}{\overset{\mu_{3}}{\underset{\nu_{3}}{\underset{\nu_{3}}{\overset{\mu_{3}}{\underset{\nu_{1}}{\underset{\nu_{1}}{\underset{1}}{\underset{\nu_{1}}{\underset{1}}{\underset{\nu_{1}}}{\underset{\nu_{1}}}{\underset{\nu_{1}}}{\underset{1}{\atop_{1}}{\underset{1}}$$

higher order vertices...

 $\sim 10^3 {
m terms}$

complicated diagrams:





 $\sim 10^4 {
m terms}$

 $\sim 10^7 {\rm ~terms}$

 $\sim 10^{21} {\rm ~terms}$

On-shell simplifications

 $\varepsilon^{\mu}(p)\varepsilon^{\nu}(p)\,e^{ip\cdot x}$

← Yang-Mills polarization

Graviton plane wave: $|\text{spin } 2\rangle \sim |\text{spin } 1\rangle \otimes |\text{spin } 1\rangle$

On-shell 3-graviton vertex:

Gravity scattering amplitude:

 $\mathcal{F}^{\text{Yang-Mills amplitude}}$ $M_{\text{tree}}^{\text{GR}}(1,2,3,4) = \frac{st}{u} \Big[A_{\text{tree}}^{\text{YM}}(1,2,3,4) \Big]^2$

Gravity processes = "squares" of gauge theory ones

Kawai-Lewellen-Tye Relations ('86)

closed string ~ (left open string) × (right open string)

 \mathbf{h}

$$\mathcal{A}_{n}(\sigma) = \int_{z_{\sigma(1)} < \dots < z_{\sigma(n)}} \frac{dz_{1} \cdots dz_{n}}{\operatorname{vol}(\operatorname{SL}(2, \mathbb{R}))} \prod_{i < j} |z_{ij}|^{\alpha' k_{i} \cdot k_{j}} \exp\left[\sum_{i < j} \frac{e_{i} \cdot e_{j}}{(z_{i} - z_{j})^{2}} + \frac{k_{[i} \cdot e_{j]}}{z_{i} - z_{j}}\right]\Big|_{\text{multi-linear}}$$

KLT relations \rightarrow closed string amplitudes

$$\mathcal{M}_n = \sum_{\sigma,\rho}^{(n-3)!} \mathcal{A}_n(\sigma) \, \mathcal{S}_{\alpha'}[\sigma|\rho] \, \widetilde{\mathcal{A}}_n(\rho)$$

Bern, Dixon, Perelstein, Rozowsky

$$S[\sigma|\rho] \text{ poly. of } s_{ij} = (p_i + p_j)^2$$

$$S_{\alpha'}[\sigma|\rho] \text{ poly. of } \sin(\pi \alpha' s_{ij})$$

Bjerrum-Bohr, Damgaard, Søndergaard, Vanhove

Field theory limit
$$\Rightarrow M_n = \sum_{\sigma,\rho}^{\infty} A_n(\sigma) S[\sigma|\rho] \widetilde{A}_n$$

(n-3)!

Kawai-Lewellen-Tye Relations ('86)

closed string ~ (left open string) × (right open string)



Field theory limit
$$\Rightarrow M_n = \sum_{\sigma,\rho}^{(n-3)!} A_n(\sigma) S[\sigma|\rho] \widetilde{A}_n(\rho)$$

Double copy: $(gravity) = (gauge) \otimes (gauge)$

Color-kinematics duality

Consider Yang-Mills 4p tree amplitude:



color factors: $c_s = f^{a_1 a_2 b} f^{b a_3 a_4}$

kinematic numerators:

$$n_{s} = \left[(\varepsilon_{1} \cdot \varepsilon_{2}) p_{1}^{\mu} + 2(\varepsilon_{1} \cdot p_{2}) \varepsilon_{2}^{\mu} - (1 \leftrightarrow 2) \right] \left[(\varepsilon_{3} \cdot \varepsilon_{4}) p_{3\mu} + 2(\varepsilon_{3} \cdot p_{4}) \varepsilon_{4\mu} - (3 \leftrightarrow 4) \right] \\ + s \left[(\varepsilon_{1} \cdot \varepsilon_{3}) (\varepsilon_{2} \cdot \varepsilon_{4}) - (\varepsilon_{1} \cdot \varepsilon_{4}) (\varepsilon_{2} \cdot \varepsilon_{3}) \right],$$

consider gauge transformation $~~\delta A_{\mu}=\partial_{\mu}\phi$

$$n_{s}\Big|_{\varepsilon_{4}\to p_{4}} = s\Big[(\varepsilon_{1}\cdot\varepsilon_{2})\big((\varepsilon_{3}\cdot p_{2}) - (\varepsilon_{3}\cdot p_{1})\big) + \operatorname{cyclic}(1,2,3)\Big] \equiv s\,\alpha(\varepsilon,p)$$

(individual diagrams not gauge inv.)

Color-kinematics duality

Consider Yang-Mills 4p tree amplitude:



color factors: $c_s = f^{a_1 a_2 b} f^{b a_3 a_4}$

kinematic numerators:

$$n_{s} = \left[(\varepsilon_{1} \cdot \varepsilon_{2}) p_{1}^{\mu} + 2(\varepsilon_{1} \cdot p_{2}) \varepsilon_{2}^{\mu} - (1 \leftrightarrow 2) \right] \left[(\varepsilon_{3} \cdot \varepsilon_{4}) p_{3\mu} + 2(\varepsilon_{3} \cdot p_{4}) \varepsilon_{4\mu} - (3 \leftrightarrow 4) \right] \\ + s \left[(\varepsilon_{1} \cdot \varepsilon_{3}) (\varepsilon_{2} \cdot \varepsilon_{4}) - (\varepsilon_{1} \cdot \varepsilon_{4}) (\varepsilon_{2} \cdot \varepsilon_{3}) \right],$$

consider gauge transformation $~~\delta A_{\mu}=\partial_{\mu}\phi$

$$\frac{n_s c_s}{s} + \frac{n_t c_t}{t} + \frac{n_u c_u}{u} \Big|_{\varepsilon_4 \to p_4} = \underbrace{(c_s + c_t + c_u) \alpha(\varepsilon, p)}_{= 0 \text{ Jacobi identity}}$$

Color-kinematics duality

Consider Yang-Mills 4p tree amplitude:



color factors: $c_s = f^{a_1 a_2 b} f^{b a_3 a_4}$

kinematic numerators:

$$n_{s} = \left[(\varepsilon_{1} \cdot \varepsilon_{2}) p_{1}^{\mu} + 2(\varepsilon_{1} \cdot p_{2}) \varepsilon_{2}^{\mu} - (1 \leftrightarrow 2) \right] \left[(\varepsilon_{3} \cdot \varepsilon_{4}) p_{3\mu} + 2(\varepsilon_{3} \cdot p_{4}) \varepsilon_{4\mu} - (3 \leftrightarrow 4) \right] \\ + s \left[(\varepsilon_{1} \cdot \varepsilon_{3}) (\varepsilon_{2} \cdot \varepsilon_{4}) - (\varepsilon_{1} \cdot \varepsilon_{4}) (\varepsilon_{2} \cdot \varepsilon_{3}) \right],$$

 $c_s + c_t + c_u = 0$ Jacobi Id. (gauge invariance) \Leftrightarrow $n_s + n_t + n_u = 0$ kinematic Jacobi Id. (diffeomorphism inv.) BCJ ('08)

Double copy

Color and kinematics are dual...

S

 $c_s + c_t + c_u = 0 \quad \Leftrightarrow \quad n_s + n_t + n_u = 0$

...replace color by kinematics $c_i \rightarrow n_i$ BCJ double copy

$$\frac{2}{1} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \frac{n_s^2}{s} + \frac{n_t^2}{t} + \frac{n_u^2}{u} \quad \leftarrow \text{ gravity ampl.}$$
Properties of ampl:
$$\begin{cases} \text{spin-2 scattering} & \varepsilon_{\mu\nu} = \varepsilon_{\mu}\varepsilon_{\nu} \\ \text{2-derivative interactions} & \partial_{\mu} \to \partial_{\mu}\partial_{\nu} \\ \text{diffeomorphism inv.} & \delta h_{\mu\nu} = \partial_{\mu}\xi_{\nu} + \partial_{\nu}\xi_{\mu} \end{cases}$$

$$\frac{n_s^2}{s} + \frac{n_t^2}{t} + \frac{n_u^2}{u} \Big|_{\varepsilon_4^{\mu\nu} \to p_4^{\mu}\varepsilon_4^{\nu} + p_4^{\nu}\varepsilon_4^{\mu}} = 2(n_s + n_t + n_u) \alpha(\varepsilon, p) = 0$$

General multiplicity and loop order

Gauge theories are controlled by a hidden kinematic Lie algebra \rightarrow Amplitude represented by cubic graphs:

$$\mathcal{A}_m^{(L)} = \sum_{i \in \Gamma_3} \int \frac{d^{LD}\ell}{(2\pi)^{LD}} \frac{1}{S_i} \frac{n_i c_i}{p_{i_1}^2 p_{i_2}^2 p_{i_3}^2 \cdots p_{i_l}^2} \leftarrow \text{propagators}$$

Color & kinematic numerators satisfy same relations:



numerators

General multiplicity and loop order

Gauge theories are controlled by a hidden kinematic Lie algebra \rightarrow Amplitude represented by cubic graphs:

$$\mathcal{A}_{m}^{(L)} = \sum_{i \in \Gamma_{3}} \int \frac{d^{LD}\ell}{(2\pi)^{LD}} \frac{1}{S_{i}} \frac{n_{i}c_{i}}{p_{i_{1}}^{2}p_{i_{2}}^{2}p_{i_{3}}^{2} \cdots p_{i_{l}}^{2}} \leftarrow \text{propagators}$$

Color & kinematic numerators satisfy same relations:





numerators

Gravity as a double copy

Gravity amplitudes obtained by replacing color with kinematics

$$\begin{split} \mathcal{A}_{m}^{(L)} &= \sum_{i \in \Gamma_{3}} \int \frac{d^{LD}\ell}{(2\pi)^{LD}} \frac{1}{S_{i}} \frac{n_{i}c_{i}}{p_{i_{1}}^{2}p_{i_{2}}^{2}p_{i_{3}}^{2}\cdots p_{i_{l}}^{2}} \\ \mathcal{M}_{m}^{(L)} &= \sum_{i \in \Gamma_{3}} \int \frac{d^{LD}\ell}{(2\pi)^{LD}} \frac{1}{S_{i}} \frac{n_{i}\tilde{n}_{i}}{p_{i_{1}}^{2}p_{i_{2}}^{2}p_{i_{3}}^{2}\cdots p_{i_{l}}^{2}} \end{split}$$
double copy

- (pure YM) \otimes (pure YM) = GR + ϕ + $B^{\mu\nu}$
- $QCD \otimes QCD = GR + matter$ (Einstein-Maxwell)
- $(YM) \otimes (YM + \phi^3) = GR + YM$ (Einstein-Yang-Mills)

and many more...

 \rightarrow (gauge sym) \otimes (gauge sym) = diffeo sym

Generality of double copy



Some generalizations:

- -> Theories not truncations of max SUGRA HJ, Ochirov; Chiodaroli, Gunaydin, Roiban
- → Theories with fundamental matter HJ, Ochirov; Chiodaroli, Gunaydin, Roiban
- → Spontaneously broken theories Chiodaroli, Gunaydin, HJ, Roiban
- → Form factors Boels, Kniehl, Tarasov, Yang
- → Gravity off-shell symmetries from YM Anastasiou, Borsten, Duff, Hughes, Nagy
- → Classical (black hole) solutions Luna, Monteiro, O'Connell, White; Ridgway, Wise; Goldberger,...
- -> Amplitudes in curved background Adamo, Casali, Mason, Nekovar, Alday, Zhou, Roiban, Teng,...
- → CHY scattering eqs, twistor strings Cachazo, He, Yuan, Skinner, Mason, Geyer, Adamo, Monteiro,...
- New double copies for string theory
 Mafra, Schlotterer, Stieberger, Taylor, Broedel, Carrasco...
 Azevedo, Marco Chiodaroli, HJ, Schlotterer
- → Conformal gravity HJ, Nohle

Double copy and gravitational waves



Explicit PM calculations done using double copy: Bjerrum-Bohr, Damgaard, Festuccia, Planté, Vanhove ('18) Bern, Cheung, Roiban, Shen, Solon, Zeng ('19)+ Ruf, Parra-Martinez ('21) Brandhuber, Chen, Travaglini, Wen (21)

Some methods developed for PM calc. using double copy:Bjerrum-Bohr, Cristofoli, Damgaard, Gomez+Brown;SeeCristofoli, Gonzo, Kosower, O'Connell;Luna, Nicholson, O'Connell, White; ...Maybee, O'Connell, Vines; Luna, Nicholson, O'Connell, White; ...Luna, Nicholson, O'Connell, White; ...

See Kosower's lectures!

GR + non-spinning matter

Exact formula tree-level GR:

$$M_n = \sum_{\Gamma} \frac{\mathcal{N}^2(\Gamma)}{D_{\Gamma}}$$
(all cubic graphs Γ)

Brandhuber, Chen, HJ, Travaglini, Wen

Numerator function:

$$\mathcal{N}(\phi_0, 1, 2, ..., n-1, \phi_n) = \sum_{\tau \in OP(2, ..., n-1)} \frac{v \cdot F_{1\tau_1} \cdot V_{\tau_2} \cdot F_{\tau_2} \cdots V_{\tau_r} \cdot F_{\tau_r}}{(n-2)v \cdot p_1 v \cdot p_{1\tau_1} \cdots v \cdot p_{1\tau_1\tau_2 \cdots \tau_r}}$$



$$F^{\mu\nu}_{\sigma} = (F_{\sigma_1} \cdot F_{\sigma_2} \cdots F_{\sigma_s})^{\mu\nu}$$
$$V^{\mu\nu}_{\tau_i} = p^{\mu}_{1\tau_1 \cdots \tau_{i-1} \cap 1 \dots \tau_{i[1]}} v^{\nu}$$

comes from heavy-mass limit of non-spining particle

Schwarzschild BH ?

Similar formulas: Edison, Teng; Mangan, Cheung; Bjerrum-Bohr, Damgaard, Sondergaad, Vanhove

Scattering amplitudes for Kerr BH

Recap of massive spinor helicity

Following AHH we bold massive spinors, and symmetrize little group

$$|\mathbf{i}\rangle \equiv |i^a\rangle z_{i,a}, \qquad |\mathbf{i}] \equiv |i^a] z_{i,a}$$

Analytic fn's of the spinors can now be constructed

$$\langle \mathbf{12} \rangle^{2s} = \text{degree-}4s \text{ polynomial in } (z_1^a, z_2^a)$$

Massive polarizations are null vectors Chiodaroli, HJ, Pichini

$$\boldsymbol{\varepsilon}_{i}^{\mu} = \frac{\langle \mathbf{i} | \sigma^{\mu} | \mathbf{i}]}{\sqrt{2}m_{i}} = \frac{[\mathbf{i} | \bar{\sigma}^{\mu} | \mathbf{i} \rangle}{\sqrt{2}m_{i}} = (z_{i}^{1})^{2} \varepsilon_{i,-}^{\mu} - \sqrt{2} z_{i}^{1} z_{i}^{2} \varepsilon_{i,L}^{\mu} - (z_{i}^{2})^{2} \varepsilon_{i,+}^{\mu}$$

Guarantees that higher-spin states are symmetric, transverse and traceless

$$\varepsilon_i^{\mu_1\mu_2\cdots\mu_s} \equiv \varepsilon_i^{\mu_1}\varepsilon_i^{\mu_2}\cdots\varepsilon_i^{\mu_s} = \text{degree-}2s \text{ polynomial in } z_i^a$$

(and gamma-traceless for fermions)

AHH amplitudes \leftrightarrow Kerr BH?

Arkani-Hamed, Huang, Huang wrote down natural higher-spin amplitudes:

Gauge th 3pt: $A(1\phi^s, 2\bar{\phi}^s, 3A^+) = mx \frac{\langle \mathbf{12} \rangle^{2s}}{m^{2s}}, \qquad A(1\phi^s, 2\bar{\phi}^s, 3A^-) = \frac{m}{x} \frac{[\mathbf{12}]^{2s}}{m^{2s}}$

Gravity 3pt: $M(1\phi^{s}, 2\bar{\phi}^{s}, 3h^{+}) = im^{2}x^{2}\frac{\langle \mathbf{12} \rangle^{2s}}{m^{2s}}, \qquad M(1\phi^{s}, 2\bar{\phi}^{s}, 3h^{-}) = i\frac{m^{2}}{x^{2}}\frac{[\mathbf{12}]^{2s}}{m^{2s}}$

Shown to reproduce Kerr by: Guevara, Ochirov, Vines

Gravity Compton ampl. $M(1\phi^s, 2\bar{\phi}^s, 3h^+, 4h^+) = i \frac{\langle 12 \rangle^{2s} [34]^4}{m^{2s-4}s_{12}t_{13}t_{14}}$ via BCFW recursion ?

$$M(1\phi^s, 2\bar{\phi}^s, 3h^-, 4h^+) = i \frac{[4|p_1|3\rangle^{4-2s}([4\mathbf{1}]\langle 3\mathbf{2}\rangle + [4\mathbf{2}]\langle 3\mathbf{1}\rangle)^{2s}}{s_{12}t_{13}t_{14}}$$

spurious pole for s>2

What EFTs give the AHH amplitudes ?

Rewrite the 3pt AHH amplitudes on covariant form \rightarrow identify theory

1) introduce generating series, e.g.

Chiodaroli, HJ, Pichini; HJ, Ochirov

$$\sum_{s=0}^{\infty} A(1\phi^s, 2\bar{\phi}^s, 3A^+) = \frac{mx}{1 - \frac{\langle \mathbf{12} \rangle^2}{m^2}}$$

2) rewrite covariantly (for both helicity sectors):

$$\sum_{s=0}^{\infty} A(1\phi^s, 2\bar{\phi}^s, 3A) = A_{\phi\phi A} + \frac{A_{WWA} - (\varepsilon_1 \cdot \varepsilon_2)^2 A_{\phi\phi A}}{(1 + \varepsilon_1 \cdot \varepsilon_2)^2 + \frac{2}{m^2}\varepsilon_1 \cdot p_2 \varepsilon_2 \cdot p_1}$$

$$A_{\phi\phi A} \equiv i\sqrt{2}\,\varepsilon_3 \cdot p_1 \,, \quad A_{WWA} \equiv i\sqrt{2}\,(\boldsymbol{\varepsilon}_1 \cdot \boldsymbol{\varepsilon}_2 \,\varepsilon_3 \cdot p_2 + \boldsymbol{\varepsilon}_2 \cdot \varepsilon_3 \,\boldsymbol{\varepsilon}_1 \cdot p_3 + \varepsilon_3 \cdot \boldsymbol{\varepsilon}_1 \,\boldsymbol{\varepsilon}_2 \cdot p_1)$$

 $s=0 \ \& \ s=1/2$ minimally coupled scalar & fermion s=1 W-boson s=3/2 charged/massive gravitino

EFTs for AHH 3pt gravity amplitudes?

Are related to the gauge th. ones via KLT

 $M(1\phi^{s}, 2\bar{\phi}^{s}, 3h^{\pm}) = iA(1\phi^{s_{\rm L}}, 2\bar{\phi}^{s_{\rm L}}, 3A^{\pm})A(1\phi^{s_{\rm R}}, 2\bar{\phi}^{s_{\rm R}}, 3A^{\pm})$

Works for any decomposition: $s=s_{\mathrm{L}}+s_{\mathrm{R}}$

Preferred decomposition s = 1 + (s - 1) give fewest derivatives :

$$\sum_{2s=0}^{\infty} M(1\phi^s, 2\bar{\phi}^s, 3h) = M_{0\oplus 1/2} + A_{WWA} \Big(A_{0\oplus 1/2} + \frac{A_{1\oplus 3/2} - (\varepsilon_1 \cdot \varepsilon_2)^2 A_{0\oplus 1/2}}{(1 + \varepsilon_1 \cdot \varepsilon_2)^2 + \frac{2}{m^2} \varepsilon_1 \cdot p_2 \varepsilon_2 \cdot p_1} \Big)$$

From double-copy structure, we can infer:

$$s=0,\ s=1/2,\ s=1,\ s=3/2$$
 minimally-coupled matter (Proca th, massive gravitino) $s=2$ Kaluza-Klein graviton

Also works for Compton, and higher-point amplitudes (Lagrangians known)

Summary of EFTs

The AHH amplitudes for s < 2 admit double copies to any multiplicity $(YM + scalar) \otimes (YM + scalar) = (GR + scalar)$ $(YM + scalar) \otimes (YM + fermion) = (GR + fermion)$ $(YM + scalar) \otimes (YM + W-boson) = (GR + Proca)$ $(YM + W\text{-boson}) \otimes (YM + \text{fermion}) = (GR + \text{massive gravitino})$ $(YM + W-boson) \otimes (YM + W-boson) = (GR + massive KK graviton)$ Lagrangians unique: have no non-minimal terms beyond cubic order in fields Can be used for $(S^{\mu})^{\leq 4}$ PM/PN calculations. see Levi's lectures Compton $(S^{\mu})^4$ yet to be confirmed via other methods (BHPT, worldline).

What special about the EFTs ?

The $\,s \leq 1\,$ gauge theories and $s \leq 2\,$ gravities admit a massless limit and all states that carries vector indices acquires a gauge symmetry

$$s = 1$$
 (YM + W-boson) \rightarrow non-abelian gauge symmetry
 $s = 3/2$ (GR + massive gravitino) \rightarrow supersymmetry
 $s = 2$ (GR + massive KK graviton) \rightarrow General covariance

See Pichini's talk for the higher-spin continuation !

(Note: we only study amplitudes with 2 massive states, and *n*-2 massless in which case the enlarged theories consistently truncate)

Conclusions

- $\,$ Studied double copies for massive $_{S}<2$ states coupled to GR
- $\,$ $\,$ All can be written in terms gauge theories with massive spin $\,$ s $\,$ $\,$ $\,$ $\,$ $\,$ $\,$ $\,$ 1 $\,$
- ${\scriptstyle
 m oldsymbol{s}}$ For Compton amplitudes with $\,s=5/2$ things are more complicated
- **•** Obtained EFT Lagrangians to all order in the fields.
- Do the amplitudes match Kerr black holes ?
- **•** Further work is needed for spin-3 and higher amplitudes.
- Outlook: results should be useful for simplifying PN/PM calculations!

Extra Slides

Which gauge theories obey C-K duality

Bern, Carrasco, HJ ('08) Bjerrum-Bohr, Damgaard, Vanhove; Stieberger; Feng et al. Mafra, Schlotterer, etc ('08-'11)

- **Pure** $\mathcal{N}=0,1,2,4$ super-Yang-Mills (any dimension)_
- Self-dual Yang-Mills theory O'Connell, Monteiro ('11)
- Heterotic string theory Stieberger, Taylor ('14)
- **Solution** Yang-Mills + F^3 theory Broedel, Dixon ('12)
- QCD, super-QCD, higher-dim QCD HJ, Ochirov ('15); Kälin, Mogull ('17)
- Generic matter coupled to \mathcal{N} = 0,1,2,4 super-Yang-Mills Chiodaroli, Gunaydin, Roiban; HJ, Ochirov ('14)
- **Spontaneously broken** \mathcal{N} = 0,2,4 SYM Chiodaroli, Gunaydin, HJ, Roiban ('15)
- **Solution** Yang-Mills + scalar ϕ^3 theory Chiodaroli, Gunaydin, HJ, Roiban ('14)
- Series Bi-adjoint scalar ϕ^3 theory Bern, de Freitas, Wong ('99), Bern, Dennen, Huang; Du, Feng, Fu; Bjerrum-Bohr, Damgaard, Monteiro, O'Connell
- NLSM/Chiral Lagrangian Chen, Du ('13)
- D=3 BLG theory (Chern-Simons-matter) Bargheer, He, McLoughlin; Huang, HJ, Lee ('12 -'13)
- (Non-)Abelian Z-theory Carrasco, Mafra, Schlotterer ('16)
- **Dim-6 gauge theories:** $(DF)^2 + F^3 + \dots$ HJ, Nohle ('17)

Which gravity theories are double copies

- **Pure** $\mathcal{N}=4,5,6,8$ supergravity (2 < D < 11) KLT ('86), Bern, Carrasco, HJ ('08-'10)
- **S** Einstein gravity and pure $\mathcal{N}=1,2,3$ supergravity HJ, Ochirov ('14)
- **D**=6 pure $\mathcal{N}=(1,1)$ and $\mathcal{N}=(2,0)$ supergravity HJ, Kälin, Mogull ('17)
- Self-dual gravity O'Connell, Monteiro ('11)
- Closed string theories Mafra, Schlotterer, Stieberger ('11); Stieberger, Taylor ('14)
- Einstein + R³ theory Broedel, Dixon ('12)
- Abelian matter coupled to supergravity Carrasco, Chiodaroli, Gunaydin, Roiban ('12) HJ, Ochirov ('14 - '15)
- Magical sugra, homogeneous sugra Chiodaroli, Gunaydin, HJ, Roiban ('15)
- **S** (S)YM coupled to (super)gravity Chiodaroli, Gunaydin, HJ, Roiban ('14)
- Spontaneously broken YM-Einstein gravity Chiodaroli, Gunaydin, HJ, Roiban ('15)
- D=3 supergravity (BLG Chern-Simons-matter theory)² Bargheer, He, McLoughlin; Huang, HJ, Lee ('12 -'13)
- Born-Infeld, DBI, Galileon theories (CHY form) Cachazo, He, Yuan ('14)
- $\mathcal{N}=0,1,2,4$ conformal supergravity HJ, Nohle ('17)