## A massive S-matrix from massless amplitudes

#### Michael Kiermaier

Princeton University

### NBI Summer Institute, Aug 29, 2011

based on:

N. Craig, H. Elvang, MK, T. Slatyer 1104.2050 MK 1105.5385

## On-shell methods: Successes

Tremendous conceptual progress in

- massless
- o planar
- maximally supersymmetric Yang-Mills theory.

#### On-shell methods: Successes

Tremendous conceptual progress in

- massless
- o planar
- maximally supersymmetric Yang-Mills theory.

#### Challenges

 $\bullet$  draw lessons for less "special" theories from massless  $\mathcal{N}=4$  SYM

### On-shell methods: Successes

Tremendous conceptual progress in

- massless
- o planar
- maximally supersymmetric Yang-Mills theory.

#### Challenges

 $\bullet$  draw lessons for less "special" theories from massless  $\mathcal{N}=4$  SYM

Even better:

Recycle results in massless  $\mathcal{N} = 4$  SYM for other theories?

★ ∃ >

## Motivation



# Motivation



Can we somehow cheat:

Compute massive amplitudes from massless on-shell amplitudes?

- on-shell amplitudes
- light-like Wilson loops
- light-like correlation functions

- on-shell amplitudes
- light-like Wilson loops
- light-like correlation functions
- gauge theory=(gravity)<sup>2</sup> at tree and loop-level [KLT, BCJ]

- on-shell amplitudes
- light-like Wilson loops
- light-like correlation functions
- gauge theory=(gravity)<sup>2</sup> at tree and loop-level [KLT, BCJ]
- form factors
- $\beta$  functions from bubble coefficients

- on-shell amplitudes
- light-like Wilson loops
- light-like correlation functions
- gauge theory=(gravity)<sup>2</sup> at tree and loop-level [KLT, BCJ]
- form factors
- $\beta$  functions from bubble coefficients

What about spontaneous symmetry breaking?

4 / 29

- on-shell amplitudes
- light-like Wilson loops
- light-like correlation functions
- gauge theory=(gravity)<sup>2</sup> at tree and loop-level [KLT, BCJ]
- form factors
- $\beta$  functions from bubble coefficients

What about spontaneous symmetry breaking? Specifically: Can we compute amplitudes in the spontaneously broken theory from on-shell amplitudes in the unbroken theory?



#### 2 Coulomb-branch S-matrix from massless amplitudes

## 3 Tests of Proposal



### 1) Review: The Coulomb-branch of $\mathcal{N}=4$ SYM

### 2 Coulomb-branch S-matrix from massless amplitudes

3 Tests of Proposal

4 A CSW-like expansion on the Coulomb branch

#### The origin of moduli space

gauge group U(M + N), R-symmetry group  $SU(4)_R$ 

- **4 ∃ ≻** 4

#### The origin of moduli space

gauge group U(M + N), R-symmetry group  $SU(4)_R$ 

### Coulomb branch: the simplest case

scalar vevs: 
$$\langle (\phi_{12})_A{}^B \rangle = \langle (\phi_{34})_A{}^B \rangle = m \delta_A{}^B$$
 for  $1 \le A, B \le M$ .





NBI

#### The origin of moduli space

gauge group U(M + N), R-symmetry group  $SU(4)_R$ 

### Coulomb branch: the simplest case

scalar vevs: 
$$\langle (\phi_{12})_A{}^B \rangle = \langle (\phi_{34})_A{}^B \rangle = m \, \delta_A{}^B$$
 for  $1 \le A, B \le M$ .



brane picture:

spontaneously breaks gauge and R-symmetry group:

 $U(M+N) \rightarrow U(M) \times U(N), \qquad SU(4)_R \rightarrow Sp(4) \supset SU(2) \times SU(2).$ 

states decompose as: 
$$A_{\mu} = \begin{pmatrix} (A_{\mu})_{N \times N} & (W_{\mu})_{N \times M} \\ (\overline{W}_{\mu})_{M \times N} & (\widetilde{A}_{\mu})_{M \times M} \end{pmatrix}$$

### Recent interest in Coulomb branch amplitudes

- as a regulator of IR divergences in the massless theory [Alday, Henn, Naculich, Plefka, Schnitzer, Schuster]
- Coulomb-branch inspired regularization of SUSY Wilson loop? [Mason, Skinner; Carot-Huot]

### Recent interest in Coulomb branch amplitudes

- as a regulator of IR divergences in the massless theory [Alday, Henn, Naculich, Plefka, Schnitzer, Schuster]
- Coulomb-branch inspired regularization of SUSY Wilson loop? [Mason, Skinner; Carot-Huot]
- as the 4d reduction of 6d massless SYM [Bern, Carrasco, Dennen, Huang, Ita; Brandhuber, Korres, Koschade, Travaglini]

### Recent interest in Coulomb branch amplitudes

- as a regulator of IR divergences in the massless theory [Alday, Henn, Naculich, Plefka, Schnitzer, Schuster]
- Coulomb-branch inspired regularization of SUSY Wilson loop? [Mason, Skinner; Carot-Huot]
- as the 4d reduction of 6d massless SYM [Bern, Carrasco, Dennen, Huang, Ita; Brandhuber, Korres, Koschade, Travaglini]
- interesting in their own right, as the simplest massive theory [Boels; Craig, Elvang, MK, Slatyer]

### Recent interest in Coulomb branch amplitudes

- as a regulator of IR divergences in the massless theory [Alday, Henn, Naculich, Plefka, Schnitzer, Schuster]
- Coulomb-branch inspired regularization of SUSY Wilson loop? [Mason, Skinner; Carot-Huot]
- as the 4d reduction of 6d massless SYM [Bern, Carrasco, Dennen, Huang, Ita; Brandhuber, Korres, Koschade, Travaglini]
- interesting in their own right, as the simplest massive theory [Boels; Craig, Elvang, MK, Slatyer]

#### Crucial simple properties

• massive and massless phase connected on moduli space of vacua

29

### Recent interest in Coulomb branch amplitudes

- as a regulator of IR divergences in the massless theory [Alday, Henn, Naculich, Plefka, Schnitzer, Schuster]
- Coulomb-branch inspired regularization of SUSY Wilson loop? [Mason, Skinner; Carot-Huot]
- as the 4d reduction of 6d massless SYM [Bern, Carrasco, Dennen, Huang, Ita; Brandhuber, Korres, Koschade, Travaglini]
- interesting in their own right, as the simplest massive theory [Boels; Craig, Elvang, MK, Slatyer]

#### Crucial simple properties

- massive and massless phase connected on moduli space of vacua
- masses of any amplitude sum to zero:  $\sum_{i} m_{i} = 0$ .

(obvious from 6d momentum conservation)

#### Convenient variables to express Coulomb-branch amplitudes?

Convenient variables to express Coulomb-branch amplitudes?

Review: Massless spinor helicity formalism

$$p_i \leftrightarrow |i\rangle [i] \quad \Rightarrow \quad \text{e.g.} \quad \left\langle g_1^- g_2^- g_3^+ \cdots g_n^+ \right\rangle = \frac{\langle 12 \rangle^4}{\langle 12 \rangle \langle 23 \rangle \cdots \langle n1 \rangle}.$$

Convenient variables to express Coulomb-branch amplitudes?

Review: Massless spinor helicity formalism

$$p_i \leftrightarrow |i\rangle [i| \Rightarrow e.g. \langle g_1^- g_2^- g_3^+ \cdots g_n^+ \rangle = \frac{\langle 12 \rangle^4}{\langle 12 \rangle \langle 23 \rangle \cdots \langle n1 \rangle}.$$

Massive spinor helicity formalism [Kleiss, Stirling; Dittmaier]

Pick arbitrary massless reference vector q

Convenient variables to express Coulomb-branch amplitudes?

Review: Massless spinor helicity formalism

$$p_i \leftrightarrow |i\rangle [i| \Rightarrow \text{e.g. } \langle g_1^- g_2^- g_3^+ \cdots g_n^+ \rangle = \frac{\langle 12 \rangle^4}{\langle 12 \rangle \langle 23 \rangle \cdots \langle n1 \rangle}.$$

### Massive spinor helicity formalism [Kleiss, Stirling; Dittmaier]

Pick arbitrary massless reference vector q, then decompose:

$$p_i \leftrightarrow |i^{\perp}\rangle [i^{\perp}| - \frac{m^2}{2 p_i \cdot q} |q\rangle [q],$$

Convenient variables to express Coulomb-branch amplitudes?

Review: Massless spinor helicity formalism

$$p_i \leftrightarrow |i\rangle [i] \quad \Rightarrow \quad \text{e.g.} \quad \left\langle g_1^- g_2^- g_3^+ \cdots g_n^+ \right\rangle = \frac{\langle 12 \rangle^4}{\langle 12 \rangle \langle 23 \rangle \cdots \langle n1 \rangle} \,.$$

### Massive spinor helicity formalism [Kleiss, Stirling; Dittmaier]

Pick arbitrary massless reference vector q, then decompose:

$$p_i \leftrightarrow |i^{\perp}\rangle [i^{\perp}| - \frac{m^2}{2 p_i \cdot q} |q\rangle [q], \qquad \epsilon^+ = \frac{\sqrt{2} |q\rangle [i^{\perp}|}{\langle i^{\perp} q \rangle}, \quad \epsilon^- = \frac{\sqrt{2} |i^{\perp}\rangle [q]}{[i^{\perp} q]}, \ldots$$

Convenient variables to express Coulomb-branch amplitudes?

Review: Massless spinor helicity formalism

$$p_i \leftrightarrow |i\rangle [i] \quad \Rightarrow \quad \text{e.g.} \quad \left\langle g_1^- g_2^- g_3^+ \cdots g_n^+ \right\rangle = \frac{\langle 12 \rangle^4}{\langle 12 \rangle \langle 23 \rangle \cdots \langle n1 \rangle} \,.$$

### Massive spinor helicity formalism [Kleiss, Stirling; Dittmaier]

Pick arbitrary massless reference vector q, then decompose:

$$p_i \leftrightarrow |i^{\perp}\rangle [i^{\perp}| - \frac{m^2}{2 p_i \cdot q} |q\rangle [q|, \qquad \epsilon^+ = \frac{\sqrt{2} |q\rangle [i^{\perp}|}{\langle i^{\perp} q \rangle}, \quad \epsilon^- = \frac{\sqrt{2} |i^{\perp}\rangle [q|}{[i^{\perp} q]}, \ldots$$

#### Reference vector q

- introduced as a technical tool, defines a basis of "helicity amplitudes"
- BUT: has no direct physical significance or interpretation!

Michael Kiermaier (Princeton University) A massive S-matrix from massless amplitudes

NBI Aug 29, 2011 9 / 29

## Example: Ultra-helicity violating (UHV) amplitudes

4-point amplitude:

$$\left\langle W_1^- \overline{W}_2^+ \, g_3^+ \, g_4^+ \right
angle \; = \; - \; rac{m^2 \langle q 1^\perp 
angle^2 [34]}{\langle q 2^\perp 
angle^2 \langle 34 
angle (P_{23}^2 + m^2)} \, .$$

### Example: Ultra-helicity violating (UHV) amplitudes

 $\begin{array}{lll} \text{4-point amplitude:} & \left\langle W_1^- \overline{W}_2^+ g_3^+ g_4^+ \right\rangle \ = \ - \frac{m^2 \langle q 1^\perp \rangle^2 [34]}{\langle q 2^\perp \rangle^2 \langle 34 \rangle (P_{23}^2 + m^2)} \, . \\ \text{n-point amplitude:} & \left[ \text{see also: Forde, Kosower; Ferrario et al} \right] \\ & \left\langle W_1^- \overline{W}_2^+ g_3^+ \dots g_n^+ \right\rangle \\ & = \ - \frac{m^2 \langle q 1^\perp \rangle^2}{\langle q 2^\perp \rangle^2 \langle 34 \rangle \langle 45 \rangle \dots \langle n-1, n \rangle (P_{n1}^2 + m^2)} \times \left[ 3 \right| \prod_{j=3}^{n-2} \left[ 1 + \frac{P_J |j+1\rangle [j+1|}{P_J^2 + m^2} \right] |n] \, . \end{array}$ 

## Example: Ultra-helicity violating (UHV) amplitudes

 $\begin{array}{lll} \text{4-point amplitude:} & \left\langle W_1^- \overline{W}_2^+ g_3^+ g_4^+ \right\rangle \ = \ - \frac{m^2 \langle q 1^\perp \rangle^2 [34]}{\langle q 2^\perp \rangle^2 \langle 34 \rangle (P_{23}^2 + m^2)} \, . \\ \text{n-point amplitude:} \ [\text{see also: Forde, Kosower; Ferrario et al}] \\ & \left\langle W_1^- \overline{W}_2^+ g_3^+ \dots g_n^+ \right\rangle \\ & = \ - \frac{m^2 \langle q 1^\perp \rangle^2}{\langle q 2^\perp \rangle^2 \langle 34 \rangle \langle 45 \rangle \dots \langle n-1, n \rangle (P_{n1}^2 + m^2)} \times \left[ 3 \right| \prod_{j=3}^{n-2} \left[ 1 + \frac{P_J |j+1\rangle [j+1|}{P_J^2 + m^2} \right] |n] \, . \end{array}$ 

### Example: Maximally SU(4)-violating amplitudes

4-point amplitude: 
$$\langle W^- \overline{W}^+ \phi^{34} \phi^{34} \rangle = -\frac{m^2 \langle 1^\perp |q| 2^\perp]}{\langle 2^\perp |q| 1^\perp] (P_{23}^2 + m^2)}$$

## Example: Ultra-helicity violating (UHV) amplitudes

 $\begin{array}{lll} \text{4-point amplitude:} & \left\langle W_1^- \overline{W}_2^+ g_3^+ g_4^+ \right\rangle \ = \ - \frac{m^2 \langle q 1^\perp \rangle^2 [34]}{\langle q 2^\perp \rangle^2 \langle 34 \rangle (P_{23}^2 + m^2)} \, . \\ \text{n-point amplitude:} & \left[ \text{see also: Forde, Kosower; Ferrario et al} \right] \\ & \left\langle W_1^- \overline{W}_2^+ g_3^+ \dots g_n^+ \right\rangle \\ & = \ - \frac{m^2 \langle q 1^\perp \rangle^2}{\langle q 2^\perp \rangle^2 \langle 34 \rangle \langle 45 \rangle \dots \langle n-1, n \rangle (P_{n1}^2 + m^2)} \times \left[ 3 \right| \prod_{j=3}^{n-2} \left[ 1 + \frac{P_J |j+1\rangle [j+1|}{P_J^2 + m^2} \right] |n] \, . \end{array}$ 

### Example: Maximally SU(4)-violating amplitudes

4-point amplitude: 
$$\langle W^- \overline{W}^+ \phi^{34} \phi^{34} \rangle = - \frac{m^2 \langle 1^\perp |q| 2^\perp]}{\langle 2^\perp |q| 1^\perp] (P_{23}^2 + m^2)}$$

n-point amplitude:

$$\langle W_1^- \overline{W}_2^+ \phi_3^{34} \dots \phi_n^{34} \rangle = \frac{-m^{n-2} \langle 1^\perp |q| 2^\perp]}{\langle 2^\perp |q| 1^\perp] (P_{23}^2 + m^2) (P_{234}^2 + m^2) \dots (P_{23\dots n-1}^2 + m^2)}.$$

#### Review: The Coulomb-branch of $\mathcal{N} = 4$ SYM

### 2 Coulomb-branch S-matrix from massless amplitudes

### 3 Tests of Proposal

4 A CSW-like expansion on the Coulomb branch

#### Goal

Coulomb branch S-matrix =  $\sum$  massless on-shell amplitudes

#### Goal

Coulomb branch S-matrix  $= \sum$  massless on-shell amplitudes

#### Idea

Probe the moduli space through scalar soft limits!

< ∃ >

#### Goal

Coulomb branch S-matrix  $= \sum$  massless on-shell amplitudes

#### Idea

Probe the moduli space through scalar soft limits!

## Compare: Adler zeros, Soft-pion theorems

- Goldstone bosons: soft-limits probe vacuum manifold
- BUT: Goldstone bosons ⇔ global symmetry ⇔ all vacua equivalent
- soft scalar limits vanish!

$$\lim_{\epsilon \to 0} \langle \phi_{\epsilon q} \dots \rangle = \mathbf{0}.$$

12 / 29

#### Goal

Coulomb branch S-matrix  $= \sum$  massless on-shell amplitudes

#### Idea

Probe the moduli space through scalar soft limits!

## Compare: Adler zeros, Soft-pion theorems

- Goldstone bosons: soft-limits probe vacuum manifold
- BUT: Goldstone bosons ⇔ global symmetry ⇔ all vacua equivalent
- soft scalar limits vanish!

$$\lim_{\epsilon \to 0} \langle \phi_{\epsilon q} \dots \rangle = \mathbf{0}.$$

• old theorem with modern applications: finiteness of N = 8 supergravity for L < 7 loops!

12 / 29
#### Goal

Coulomb branch S-matrix

$$= \sum mas$$

#### massless on-shell amplitudes

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \ldots \rangle \stackrel{?}{=} \langle g_1 g_2 \ldots \rangle + O(m)$$

#### Goal

Coulomb branch S-matrix =

$$=$$
  $\sum$  massless on-shell amplitudes

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \ldots \rangle \stackrel{?}{=} \langle g_1 g_2 \ldots \rangle + \langle g_1 \phi_q^{vev} g_2 \ldots \rangle + O(m^2)$$

#### Goal

Coulomb branch S-matrix =

$$= \sum$$
 massle

#### massless on-shell amplitudes

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \ldots \rangle \stackrel{?}{=} \langle g_1 g_2 \ldots \rangle + \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \ldots \rangle + O(m^2)$$

#### Goal

Coulomb branch S-matrix

$$= \sum mas$$

#### nassless on-shell amplitudes

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle \stackrel{?}{=} \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q_1}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q_2}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q_s}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle.$$

#### Goal

Coulomb branch S-matrix

$$= \sum ma$$

#### nassless on-shell amplitudes

### Naive ansatz:

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle \stackrel{?}{=} \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q_1}^{\operatorname{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q_2}^{\operatorname{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q_s}^{\operatorname{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle.$$

#### Puzzles

Michael Kiermaier (Princeton University) A massive S-matrix from massless amplitudes NBI

< 行

Goal

Coulomb branch S-matrix

$$= \sum$$
 massles

#### massless on-shell amplitudes

Naive ansatz:

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \ldots \rangle \stackrel{?}{=} \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q_1}^{\operatorname{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q_2}^{\operatorname{vev}} \ldots \phi_{\varepsilon q_s}^{\operatorname{vev}} g_2 \ldots \rangle.$$

### Puzzles

• massive and massless amplitude are on-shell,  $p_W^2 = -m^2$ , but  $p_g^2 = 0!$ How are momenta related?

NBI

Goal

Coulomb branch S-matrix

$$\sum$$
 massless

#### massless on-shell amplitudes

#### Naive ansatz:

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle \stackrel{?}{=} \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q_1}^{\operatorname{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q_2}^{\operatorname{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q_s}^{\operatorname{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle.$$

### Puzzles

- massive and massless amplitude are on-shell,  $p_W^2 = -m^2$ , but  $p_g^2 = 0!$ How are momenta related?
- **2** soft-limit  $q_i$  dependent! How to choose  $q_i$ ?

NBI

Goal

Coulomb branch S-matrix =

$$\sum$$
 massless on-shell amplitudes

#### Naive ansatz:

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle \stackrel{?}{=} \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q_1}^{\operatorname{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q_2}^{\operatorname{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q_s}^{\operatorname{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle.$$

#### Puzzles

- massive and massless amplitude are on-shell,  $p_W^2 = -m^2$ , but  $p_g^2 = 0!$ How are momenta related?
- 2 soft-limit  $q_i$  dependent! How to choose  $q_i$ ?
- S massive "helicity" frame-dependent! How to choose W-polarizations?

13 / 29

Goal

Coulomb branch S-matrix =

$$\sum$$
 massless on-shell amplitudes

#### Naive ansatz:

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle \stackrel{?}{=} \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q_1}^{\operatorname{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q_2}^{\operatorname{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q_s}^{\operatorname{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle.$$

#### Puzzles

- massive and massless amplitude are on-shell,  $p_W^2 = -m^2$ , but  $p_g^2 = 0!$ How are momenta related?
- **2** soft-limit  $q_i$  dependent! How to choose  $q_i$ ?
- S massive "helicity" frame-dependent! How to choose W-polarizations?
- RHS generically ill-defined due to soft divergences!

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle \stackrel{?}{=} \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q_1}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q_2}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q_s}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle$$

Puzzle 1: How are momenta related?

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle \stackrel{?}{=} \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q_1}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q_2}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q_s}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle$$

### Puzzle 1: How are momenta related?

decompose massive W momenta as:  $p_i = p_i^{\perp} - \frac{m_i^2}{2 q \cdot p_i} q$ . choose  $p_i^{\perp}$  as massless gluon momentum on RHS!

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle \stackrel{?}{=} \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q_1}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q_2}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q_s}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle$$

### Puzzle 1: How are momenta related?

decompose massive W momenta as:  $p_i = p_i^{\perp} - \frac{m_i^2}{2 q \cdot p_i} q$ . choose  $p_i^{\perp}$  as massless gluon momentum on RHS!

#### Puzzle 2: How to map *W*-polarizations to massless states?

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle \stackrel{?}{=} \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q_1}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q_2}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q_s}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle$$

### Puzzle 1: How are momenta related?

decompose massive W momenta as:  $p_i = p_i^{\perp} - \frac{m_i^2}{2 q \cdot p_i} q$ . choose  $p_i^{\perp}$  as massless gluon momentum on RHS!

#### Puzzle 2: How to map *W*-polarizations to massless states?

• massive 
$$W$$
 polarizations  $\epsilon^+ = \frac{\sqrt{2}|q\rangle[i^{\perp}|}{\langle i^{\perp}q \rangle}, \quad \epsilon^- = \frac{\sqrt{2}|i^{\perp}\rangle[q]}{[i^{\perp}q]}$   
 $\Leftrightarrow$  massless  $\pm$ -helicity gluons.

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle \stackrel{?}{=} \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q_1}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q_2}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q_s}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle$$

#### Puzzle 1: How are momenta related?

decompose massive W momenta as:  $p_i = p_i^{\perp} - \frac{m_i^2}{2 q \cdot p_i} q$ . choose  $p_i^{\perp}$  as massless gluon momentum on RHS!

#### Puzzle 2: How to map *W*-polarizations to massless states?

• massive W polarizations  $\epsilon^+ = \frac{\sqrt{2}|q\rangle[i^{\perp}|}{\langle i^{\perp}q \rangle}, \quad \epsilon^- = \frac{\sqrt{2}|i^{\perp}\rangle[q]}{[i^{\perp}q]}$  $\Leftrightarrow$  massless  $\pm$ -helicity gluons.

• longitudinal W boson with polarization  $\notin^{L} = \frac{1}{m_{i}} \left( \not p_{i}^{\perp} + \frac{m_{i}^{2}}{2q \cdot p_{i}} \not q \right)$  $\Leftrightarrow$  massless scalar  $\frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} (\phi^{12} + \phi^{34})$ .

NBL

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle \stackrel{?}{=} \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q_1}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q_2}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q_s}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle$$

#### Puzzle 1: How are momenta related?

decompose massive W momenta as:  $p_i = p_i^{\perp} - \frac{m_i^2}{2 q \cdot p_i} q$ . choose  $p_i^{\perp}$  as massless gluon momentum on RHS!

#### Puzzle 2: How to map *W*-polarizations to massless states?

• massive W polarizations  $\epsilon^+ = \frac{\sqrt{2}|q\rangle[i^{\perp}|}{\langle i^{\perp}q \rangle}, \quad \epsilon^- = \frac{\sqrt{2}|i^{\perp}\rangle[q]}{[i^{\perp}q]}$  $\Leftrightarrow$  massless  $\pm$ -helicity gluons.

• longitudinal W boson with polarization  $\notin^{L} = \frac{1}{m_{i}} \left( \not p_{i}^{\perp} + \frac{m_{i}^{2}}{2q \cdot p_{i}} \not q \right)$  $\Leftrightarrow$  massless scalar  $\frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} (\phi^{12} + \phi^{34})$ .

#### LHS now depends on one arbitrary massless reference spinor $q \Leftrightarrow \text{RHS}$ ?

NBI

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle \stackrel{?}{=} \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q_1}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q_2}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q_s}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle$$

Puzzle 3: How to choose soft-scalar momenta  $q_i$ ?

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle \stackrel{?}{=} \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q_1}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q_2}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q_s}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle$$

Puzzle 3: How to choose soft-scalar momenta  $q_i$ ?

LHS depends only on one reference null momentum q

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle \stackrel{?}{=} \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q_1}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q_2}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q_s}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle$$

Puzzle 3: How to choose soft-scalar momenta  $q_i$ ?

LHS depends only on one reference null momentum q

 $\Rightarrow$  need to set all  $q_i = q$  to match parameters!

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle \stackrel{?}{=} \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q_1}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q_2}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q_s}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle$$

Puzzle 3: How to choose soft-scalar momenta  $q_i$ ?

LHS depends only on one reference null momentum q

 $\Rightarrow$  need to set all  $q_i = q$  to match parameters!

New Puzzle: collinear divergences as  $q_i \rightarrow q!$ 

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle \stackrel{?}{=} \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q_1}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q_2}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q_s}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle$$

Puzzle 3: How to choose soft-scalar momenta  $q_i$ ?

LHS depends only on one reference null momentum q

 $\Rightarrow$  need to set all  $q_i = q$  to match parameters!

#### New Puzzle: collinear divergences as $q_i \rightarrow q!$

collinear divergences are anti-symmetric in momenta.

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle \stackrel{?}{=} \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle_{sym}.$$

#### Puzzle 3: How to choose soft-scalar momenta $q_i$ ?

LHS depends only on one reference null momentum q

 $\Rightarrow$  need to set all  $q_i = q$  to match parameters!

#### New Puzzle: collinear divergences as $q_i \rightarrow q!$

collinear divergences are anti-symmetric in momenta.

Resolution: Symmetrize in  $q_i$  before taking the limit  $q_i \rightarrow q$ .

Makes sense, because vev scalars should not be color-ordered!

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle \stackrel{?}{=} \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle_{sym}.$$
Puzzle 4: soft-divergences in the limit  $\varepsilon \to 0$ 

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle \stackrel{?}{=} \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle_{sym} .$$
Puzzle 4: soft-divergences in the limit  $\varepsilon \to 0$ 
Finite soft limits at leading non-vanishing order!

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle \stackrel{?}{=} \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle_{sym}.$$

Puzzle 4: soft-divergences in the limit  $\varepsilon \rightarrow 0$ 

Finite soft limits at leading non-vanishing order!  $O(m^2)$  term in  $\langle W^- \overline{W}^+ \phi^{34} \phi^{34} \rangle$ :

$$\langle g_1^- \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} g_2^+ \phi_3^{34} \phi_4^{34} \rangle_{\text{sym}} = - \frac{m^2 \langle 1^\perp | q | 2^\perp ]}{\langle 2^\perp | q | 1^\perp ] (P_{23}^\perp)^2} + O(\varepsilon^1). \quad (\text{correct!}).$$

Divergent soft limits at subleading orders!

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle \stackrel{?}{=} \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle_{sym}.$$

Puzzle 4: soft-divergences in the limit  $\varepsilon \rightarrow 0$ 

Finite soft limits at leading non-vanishing order!  $O(m^2)$  term in  $\langle W^- \overline{W}^+ \phi^{34} \phi^{34} \rangle$ :

$$\left\langle g_1^- \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\mathrm{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\mathrm{vev}} g_2^+ \phi_3^{34} \phi_4^{34} \right\rangle_{\mathrm{sym}} = -\frac{m^2 \langle 1^\perp | q | 2^\perp ]}{\langle 2^\perp | q | 1^\perp ] (P_{23}^\perp)^2} + O(\varepsilon^1). \quad (\text{correct!}).$$

Divergent soft limits at subleading orders!  $O(m^4)$  term in  $\langle W^- \overline{W}^+ \phi^{34} \phi^{34} \rangle$ :

$$\left\langle g_1^- \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\mathrm{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\mathrm{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\mathrm{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\mathrm{vev}} g_2^+ \phi_3^{34} \phi_4^{34} \right\rangle_{\mathrm{sym}} = \frac{1}{\varepsilon} \times \frac{m^2 \langle 1^\perp |q| 2^\perp ]}{\langle 2^\perp |q| 1^\perp ] (P_{23}^\perp)^2} \left( \frac{m^2}{4 \, q \cdot p_1} + \frac{m^2}{4 \, q \cdot p_2} \right) + O(\varepsilon^0) \cdot \frac{m^2}{2} \left( \frac{m^2}{4 \, q \cdot p_1} + \frac{m^2}{4 \, q \cdot p_2} \right) + O(\varepsilon^0) \cdot \frac{m^2}{2} \left( \frac{m^2}{4 \, q \cdot p_1} + \frac{m^2}{4 \, q \cdot p_2} \right) + O(\varepsilon^0) \cdot \frac{m^2}{2} \left( \frac{m^2}{4 \, q \cdot p_1} + \frac{m^2}{4 \, q \cdot p_2} \right) + O(\varepsilon^0) \cdot \frac{m^2}{2} \left( \frac{m^2}{4 \, q \cdot p_1} + \frac{m^2}{4 \, q \cdot p_2} \right) + O(\varepsilon^0) \cdot \frac{m^2}{2} \left( \frac{m^2}{4 \, q \cdot p_1} + \frac{m^2}{4 \, q \cdot p_2} \right) + O(\varepsilon^0) \cdot \frac{m^2}{2} \left( \frac{m^2}{4 \, q \cdot p_1} + \frac{m^2}{4 \, q \cdot p_2} \right) + O(\varepsilon^0) \cdot \frac{m^2}{2} \left( \frac{m^2}{4 \, q \cdot p_1} + \frac{m^2}{4 \, q \cdot p_2} \right) + O(\varepsilon^0) \cdot \frac{m^2}{2} \left( \frac{m^2}{4 \, q \cdot p_1} + \frac{m^2}{4 \, q \cdot p_2} \right) + O(\varepsilon^0) \cdot \frac{m^2}{2} \left( \frac{m^2}{4 \, q \cdot p_1} + \frac{m^2}{4 \, q \cdot p_2} \right) + O(\varepsilon^0) \cdot \frac{m^2}{2} \left( \frac{m^2}{4 \, q \cdot p_1} + \frac{m^2}{4 \, q \cdot p_2} \right) + O(\varepsilon^0) \cdot \frac{m^2}{2} \left( \frac{m^2}{4 \, q \cdot p_1} + \frac{m^2}{4 \, q \cdot p_2} \right) + O(\varepsilon^0) \cdot \frac{m^2}{2} \left( \frac{m^2}{4 \, q \cdot p_1} + \frac{m^2}{4 \, q \cdot p_2} \right) + O(\varepsilon^0) \cdot \frac{m^2}{2} \left( \frac{m^2}{4 \, q \cdot p_2} + \frac{m^2}{4 \, q \cdot p_2} \right) + O(\varepsilon^0) \cdot \frac{m^2}{2} \left( \frac{m^2}{4 \, q \cdot p_2} + \frac{m^2}{4 \, q \cdot p_2} \right) + O(\varepsilon^0) \cdot \frac{m^2}{4 \, q \cdot p_2} \right)$$

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle \stackrel{?}{=} \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle_{sym}.$$

Puzzle 4: soft-divergences in the limit  $\varepsilon \rightarrow 0$ 

Finite soft limits at leading non-vanishing order!  $O(m^2)$  term in  $\langle W^- \overline{W}^+ \phi^{34} \phi^{34} \rangle$ :

$$\left\langle g_{1}^{-} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\mathrm{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\mathrm{vev}} g_{2}^{+} \phi_{3}^{34} \phi_{4}^{34} \right\rangle_{\mathrm{sym}} = - \frac{m^{2} \langle 1^{\perp} | q | 2^{\perp} ]}{\langle 2^{\perp} | q | 1^{\perp} ] (P_{23}^{\perp})^{2}} + O(\varepsilon^{1}).$$
 (correct!).

Divergent soft limits at subleading orders!  $O(m^4)$  term in  $\langle W^- \overline{W}^+ \phi^{34} \phi^{34} \rangle$ :

$$\left\langle g_{1}^{-}\phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\mathrm{vev}}\phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\mathrm{vev}}\phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\mathrm{vev}}\phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\mathrm{vev}}g_{2}^{+}\phi_{3}^{34}\phi_{4}^{34}\right\rangle_{\mathrm{sym}} = \frac{1}{\varepsilon} \times \frac{m^{2}\langle 1^{\perp}|q|2^{\perp}]}{\langle 2^{\perp}|q|1^{\perp}](P_{23}^{\perp})^{2}}\left(\frac{m^{2}}{4\,q\cdot p_{1}} + \frac{m^{2}}{4\,q\cdot p_{2}}\right) + O(\varepsilon^{0})$$

Related problem:  $O(m^2)$  violation of momentum conservation on RHS

$$\sum_{i} p_i^{\perp} = \sum_{i} \left( p_i + \frac{m_i^2}{2 q \cdot p_i} q \right) = \left[ \sum_{i=1}^n \frac{m_i^2}{2 q \cdot p_i} \right] q \neq \mathbf{0}.$$

Michael Kiermaier (Princeton University) A massive S-matrix from massless amplitudes

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle \stackrel{?}{=} \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle_{sym}.$$

### Special choice of q

We must impose

$$\sum_{i=1}^n \frac{m_i^2}{2 q \cdot p_i} = 0$$

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle \stackrel{?}{=} \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle_{sym}.$$

### Special choice of q

We must impose

$$\sum_{i=1}^n \frac{m_i^2}{2 q \cdot p_i} = 0$$

to

- prevent  $1/\varepsilon$  divergence at first subleading order on RHS.
- guarantees momentum conservation on RHS:  $\sum_i p_i^{\perp} = 0$

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle \stackrel{?}{=} \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle_{sym}.$$

### Special choice of q

We must impose

$$\sum_{i=1}^n \frac{m_i^2}{2 q \cdot p_i} = 0$$

to

- prevent 1/arepsilon divergence at first subleading order on RHS .
- guarantees momentum conservation on RHS:  $\sum_i p_i^{\perp} = 0$

only constrains choice of helicity basis!

any Coulomb-branch amplitude expressible in any *q*-helicity basis!

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle \stackrel{?}{=} \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle_{sym}.$$

### Special choice of q

We must impose

$$\sum_{i=1}^n \frac{m_i^2}{2 q \cdot p_i} = 0$$

to

- prevent 1/arepsilon divergence at first subleading order on RHS .
- guarantees momentum conservation on RHS:  $\sum_i p_i^{\perp} = 0$

only constrains choice of helicity basis!

any Coulomb-branch amplitude expressible in any *q*-helicity basis!

#### Special choice of q for two massive lines

Simple orthogonality relation:  $q \cdot (p_1 + p_2) = 0$ .

17 / 29

### Summary: Refined proposal

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle = \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle_{sym}$$

#### Summary: Refined proposal

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle = \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle_{sym}.$$

W-boson, pol $\epsilon_q^\pm$		$\pm$ -helicity gluon
W-boson, pol $\epsilon_q^L$	$\iff$	scalar $rac{1}{\sqrt{2}}(\phi^{12}\!+\!\phi^{34})$

#### Summary: Refined proposal

$$\begin{array}{ll} \left\langle \ W_1 \overline{W}_2 \ \dots \ \right\rangle & = & \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \left\langle \ g_1 \ \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\mathrm{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\mathrm{vev}} \ \dots \ \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\mathrm{vev}} \ g_2 \ \dots \ \right\rangle_{sym}. \end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{ll} \text{W-boson, pol } \epsilon_q^{\pm} & \pm \text{-helicity gluon} \\ \text{W-boson, pol } \epsilon_q^{L} & \Longleftrightarrow & \text{scalar } \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} (\phi^{12} + \phi^{34}) \\ p_i & p_i^{\perp} \equiv p_i + \frac{m_i^2}{2 \ q_{P_i}} \ q \end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{ll} \text{Special choice of } q: & \sum_{i=1}^{n} \frac{m_i^2}{2 \ q_{P_i}} \ = \ 0 & . \end{array}$$

Michael Kiermaier (Princeton University) A massive S-matrix from massless amplitudes NBI Aug 29, 2011 18 / 29

#### Summary: Refined proposal

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle = \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{vev} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{vev} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{vev} g_2 \dots \rangle_{sym}.$$

W-boson, pol $\epsilon_q^\pm$		$\pm$ -helicity gluon
W-boson, pol $\epsilon_q^L$	$\iff$	scalar $\frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}(\phi^{12}+\phi^{34})$
pi		$p_i^\perp \equiv p_i + rac{m_i^2}{2 q p_i} q$

Special choice of 
$$q$$
:  $\sum_{i=1}^{n} \frac{m_i^2}{2 q \cdot p_i} = 0$ 

### Open questions:

- show that proposal is free of soft divergences to all orders
- verify proposal for explicit Coulomb-branch amplitudes

NBI

#### Summary: Refined proposal

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle = \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle_{sym}.$$

W-boson, pol $\epsilon_q^\pm$		$\pm$ -helicity gluon
W-boson, pol $\epsilon_q^L$	$\iff$	scalar $\frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}(\phi^{12}+\phi^{34})$
pi		$p_i^\perp \equiv p_i + rac{m_i^2}{2 q p_i} q$

Special choice of 
$$q$$
:  $\sum_{i=1}^{n} \frac{m_i^2}{2 q \cdot p_i} = 0$ 

### Open questions:

- show that proposal is free of soft divergences to all orders
- verify proposal for explicit Coulomb-branch amplitudes

BUT: Infinite sum, vev-scalar symmetrization... daunting task in practice?



#### 2 Coulomb-branch S-matrix from massless amplitudes

### 3 Tests of Proposal

4 A CSW-like expansion on the Coulomb branch
$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle = \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle_{sym}.$$

• need a convenient representation for massless amplitudes

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle = \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle_{sym}.$$

- need a convenient representation for massless amplitudes
- proposal introduces reference vector  $q \Rightarrow \text{CSW}$  expansion natural!

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle = \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle_{sym}.$$

- need a convenient representation for massless amplitudes
- proposal introduces reference vector  $q \Rightarrow \mathsf{CSW}$  expansion natural!

The CSW expansion for massless amplitudes

MHV vertices, connected by scalar propagators:

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle = \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle_{sym}.$$

- need a convenient representation for massless amplitudes
- proposal introduces reference vector  $q \Rightarrow \mathsf{CSW}$  expansion natural!

The CSW expansion for massless amplitudes

MHV vertices, connected by scalar propagators:

$$\begin{array}{c} \overset{n^{+}\cdots 3^{+}}{\overbrace{1^{-}}^{2^{-}}} \\ \\ \frac{\langle 1^{\perp}2^{\perp}\rangle^{4}}{\langle 1^{\perp}2^{\perp}\rangle\cdots\langle n^{\perp}1^{\perp}} \end{array}$$

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle = \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle_{sym}.$$

- need a convenient representation for massless amplitudes
- proposal introduces reference vector  $q \Rightarrow \mathsf{CSW}$  expansion natural!

The CSW expansion for massless amplitudes

MHV vertices, connected by scalar propagators:



NBI

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle = \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle_{sym}.$$

- need a convenient representation for massless amplitudes
- proposal introduces reference vector  $q \Rightarrow \mathsf{CSW}$  expansion natural!

The CSW expansion for massless amplitudes

MHV vertices, connected by scalar propagators:



holomorphic in  $|i^{\perp}\rangle$ , CSW prescription  $|P_{I}^{\perp}\rangle \equiv P_{I}^{\perp}|q]$  for internal  $P_{I}^{\perp}$ 

# Simplification through vev-scalar symmetrization



$$\begin{array}{c} P \\ \downarrow \\ \varepsilon q_1 \\ \varepsilon q_2 \\ sym \end{array} \propto \frac{1}{\langle Pq_1 \rangle \langle q_1 q_2 \rangle \langle q_2 P \rangle} + \frac{1}{\langle Pq_2 \rangle \langle q_2 q_1 \rangle \langle q_1 P \rangle} = 0 \end{array}$$

(obvious from antisymmetry of 3-point ampliutde)

# Simplification through vev-scalar symmetrization



 $\epsilon \dot{q_1}$ 

$$\int_{\hat{\epsilon}q_{2}}^{P} \propto \frac{1}{\langle Pq_{1}\rangle\langle q_{1}q_{2}\rangle\langle q_{2}P\rangle} + \frac{1}{\langle Pq_{2}\rangle\langle q_{2}q_{1}\rangle\langle q_{1}P\rangle} = 0$$

(obvious from antisymmetry of 3-point ampliutde)



(obvious from U(1)-decoupling identity)

NBI Aug 29, 2011

# Simplification through vev-scalar symmetrization



$$\sum_{\epsilon q_1}^{P} \propto \frac{1}{\langle Pq_1 \rangle \langle q_1 q_2 \rangle \langle q_2 P \rangle} + \frac{1}{\langle Pq_2 \rangle \langle q_2 q_1 \rangle \langle q_1 P \rangle} = 0$$

(obvious from antisymmetry of 3-point ampliutde)

$$P_{\varepsilon q_1 \ \varepsilon q_2 \ \text{sym}} = 0, \qquad \varepsilon q_1 \ \varepsilon q_2 \ \varepsilon q_3 = 0, \qquad \varepsilon q_1 \ \varepsilon q_2 \ \varepsilon q_3 \ \varepsilon q_2 \ \varepsilon q_3 \ \text{sym}} = 0.$$

(obvious from U(1)-decoupling identity) vanishing vertices with more non-vev lines:

Michael Kiermaier (Princeton University) A massive S-matrix from massless amplitudes

The 4-point amplitude  $\langle W^-\overline{W}^+\phi^{34}\phi^{34}
angle$ 

$$\langle W^{-}\overline{W}^{+}\phi^{34}\phi^{34}\rangle = -\frac{m^{2}\langle 1^{\perp}|q|2^{\perp}]}{\langle 2^{\perp}|q|1^{\perp}](P_{23}^{2}+m^{2})} = -\frac{m^{2}\langle 1^{\perp}|q|2^{\perp}]}{\langle 2^{\perp}|q|1^{\perp}][(P_{23}^{\perp})^{2}-m^{2}\frac{q\cdot P_{23}}{q\cdot P_{2}}+m^{2}]}$$

The 4-point amplitude  $\langle W^- \overline{W}^+ \phi^{34} \phi^{34} \rangle$ 

$$\langle W^{-}\overline{W}^{+}\phi^{34}\phi^{34}\rangle = -\frac{m^{2}\langle 1^{\perp}|q|2^{\perp}]}{\langle 2^{\perp}|q|1^{\perp}](P_{23}^{2}+m^{2})} = -\frac{m^{2}\langle 1^{\perp}|q|2^{\perp}]}{\langle 2^{\perp}|q|1^{\perp}][(P_{23}^{\perp})^{2}-m^{2}\frac{q\cdot P_{23}}{q\cdot P_{2}}+m^{2}]}$$

#### leading order

Michael Kiermaier (Princeton University) A massive S-matrix from massless amplitudes NBI A

< 17 ▶

The 4-point amplitude  $\langle W^- \overline{W}^+ \phi^{34} \phi^{34} \rangle$ 

$$\langle W^{-}\overline{W}^{+}\phi^{34}\phi^{34}\rangle = -\frac{m^{2}\langle 1^{\perp}|q|2^{\perp}]}{\langle 2^{\perp}|q|1^{\perp}](P_{23}^{2}+m^{2})} = -\frac{m^{2}\langle 1^{\perp}|q|2^{\perp}]}{\langle 2^{\perp}|q|1^{\perp}][(P_{23}^{\perp})^{2}-m^{2}\frac{q\cdot P_{23}}{q\cdot P_{2}}+m^{2}]}$$

#### leading order

Only one diagram contributes to the massless NMHV amplitude:

$$\lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \left\langle g_1^- \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} g_2^+ \phi_3^{34} \phi_4^{34} \right\rangle_{\text{sym}} = g_1^- \underbrace{\varphi_4^{34}}_{=} g_2^+ = -\frac{m^2 \langle 1^{\perp} | q | 2^{\perp} ]}{\langle 2^{\perp} | q | 1^{\perp} ] (P_{23}^{\perp})^2}.$$

Michael Kiermaier (Princeton University) A massive S-matrix from massless amplitudes

Aug 29, 2011 22 / 29

The 4-point amplitude  $\langle W^- \overline{W}^+ \phi^{34} \phi^{34} \rangle$ 

$$\langle W^- \overline{W}^+ \phi^{34} \phi^{34} \rangle = -\frac{m^2 \langle 1^{\perp} | q | 2^{\perp} ]}{\langle 2^{\perp} | q | 1^{\perp} ] (P_{23}^2 + m^2)} = -\frac{m^2 \langle 1^{\perp} | q | 2^{\perp} ]}{\langle 2^{\perp} | q | 1^{\perp} ] [(P_{23}^{\perp})^2 - m^2 \frac{q \cdot P_{23}}{q \cdot P_2} + m^2]}$$

# Subleading order: $\langle g_1^- \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} g_2^+ \phi_3^{34} \phi_4^{34} \rangle_{\text{sym}}$

The 4-point amplitude  $\langle W^- \overline{W}^+ \phi^{34} \phi^{34} \rangle$ 

$$\langle W^{-}\overline{W}^{+}\phi^{34}\phi^{34}\rangle = -\frac{m^{2}\langle 1^{\perp}|q|2^{\perp}]}{\langle 2^{\perp}|q|1^{\perp}](P_{23}^{2}+m^{2})} = -\frac{m^{2}\langle 1^{\perp}|q|2^{\perp}]}{\langle 2^{\perp}|q|1^{\perp}][(P_{23}^{\perp})^{2}-m^{2}\frac{q\cdot P_{23}}{q\cdot P_{2}}+m^{2}]}$$

Subleading order:  $\left\langle g_1^- \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} g_2^+ \phi_3^{34} \phi_4^{34} \right\rangle_{\text{sym}}$ 



The 4-point amplitude  $\langle W^- \overline{W}^+ \phi^{34} \phi^{34} \rangle$ 

$$\langle W^- \overline{W}^+ \phi^{34} \phi^{34} \rangle = -\frac{m^2 \langle 1^{\perp} | q | 2^{\perp} ]}{\langle 2^{\perp} | q | 1^{\perp} ] (P_{23}^2 + m^2)} = -\frac{m^2 \langle 1^{\perp} | q | 2^{\perp} ]}{\langle 2^{\perp} | q | 1^{\perp} ] [(P_{23}^{\perp})^2 - m^2 \frac{q \cdot P_{23}}{q \cdot P_2} + m^2]}$$

Subleading order:  $\left\langle g_1^- \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} g_2^+ \phi_3^{34} \phi_4^{34} \right\rangle_{\text{sym}}$ 



NBI Aug 29, 2011

The 4-point amplitude  $\langle W^- \overline{W}^+ \phi^{34} \phi^{34} \rangle$ 

$$\langle W^{-}\overline{W}^{+}\phi^{34}\phi^{34}\rangle = -\frac{m^{2}\langle 1^{\perp}|q|2^{\perp}]}{\langle 2^{\perp}|q|1^{\perp}](P_{23}^{2}+m^{2})} = -\frac{m^{2}\langle 1^{\perp}|q|2^{\perp}]}{\langle 2^{\perp}|q|1^{\perp}][(P_{23}^{\perp})^{2}-m^{2}\frac{q\cdot P_{23}}{q\cdot P_{2}}+m^{2}]}$$

Subleading order:  $\langle g_1^- \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} g_2^+ \phi_3^{34} \phi_4^{34} \rangle_{\text{sym}}$ 

$$\lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} g_1^{-} \xrightarrow{\phi_4^{34}} g_2^{+} = \frac{m^2 \langle 1^{\perp} | q | 2^{\perp} ]}{\langle 2^{\perp} | q | 1^{\perp} ] (P_{23}^{\perp})^2} \times \frac{m^2}{(P_{23}^{\perp})^2} \,.$$

NBI Aug 29, 2011 22 / 29

The 4-point amplitude  $\langle W^- \overline{W}^+ \phi^{34} \phi^{34} \rangle$ 

$$\langle W^- \overline{W}^+ \phi^{34} \phi^{34} \rangle = -\frac{m^2 \langle 1^{\perp} | q | 2^{\perp} ]}{\langle 2^{\perp} | q | 1^{\perp} ] (P_{23}^2 + m^2)} = -\frac{m^2 \langle 1^{\perp} | q | 2^{\perp} ]}{\langle 2^{\perp} | q | 1^{\perp} ] [(P_{23}^{\perp})^2 - m^2 \frac{q \cdot P_{23}}{q \cdot P_2} + m^2]}$$

Subleading order:  $\langle g_1^- \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} g_2^+ \phi_3^{34} \phi_4^{34} \rangle_{\text{sym}}$ 

Finite contribution, builds up  $'+m^2'$  in propagator!

The 4-point amplitude  $\langle W^- \overline{W}^+ \phi^{34} \phi^{34} \rangle$ 

$$\langle W^- \overline{W}^+ \phi^{34} \phi^{34} \rangle = -\frac{m^2 \langle 1^{\perp} | q | 2^{\perp} ]}{\langle 2^{\perp} | q | 1^{\perp} ] (P_{23}^2 + m^2)} = -\frac{m^2 \langle 1^{\perp} | q | 2^{\perp} ]}{\langle 2^{\perp} | q | 1^{\perp} ] [(P_{23}^{\perp})^2 - m^2 \frac{q \cdot P_{23}}{q \cdot P_2} + m^2]}$$

Subleading order:  $\left\langle g_{1}^{-} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \overline{\phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} g_{2}^{+} \phi_{3}^{34} \phi_{4}^{34} \right\rangle_{\text{sym}}$ 

$$g_{1}^{-} \xrightarrow{\phi_{4}^{34} \phi_{3}^{34}} g_{2}^{+} + g_{1}^{-} \xrightarrow{\phi_{4}^{34} \phi_{3}^{34}} g_{2}^{+}$$

$$= \frac{m^2 \langle 1^{\perp} | q | 2^{\perp}]}{\langle 2^{\perp} | q | 1^{\perp}] (P_{23}^{\perp})^2} \times \left[ \frac{1}{\varepsilon} \left( \frac{m^2}{4 q \cdot p_1} + \frac{m^2}{4 q \cdot p_2} \right) - \frac{m^2 q \cdot P_{23}}{(P_{23}^{\perp})^2 q \cdot p_2} + O(\varepsilon) \right].$$

NBI

The 4-point amplitude  $\langle W^- \overline{W}^+ \phi^{34} \phi^{34} \rangle$ 

$$\langle W^- \overline{W}^+ \phi^{34} \phi^{34} \rangle = -\frac{m^2 \langle 1^{\perp} | q | 2^{\perp} ]}{\langle 2^{\perp} | q | 1^{\perp} ] (P_{23}^2 + m^2)} = -\frac{m^2 \langle 1^{\perp} | q | 2^{\perp} ]}{\langle 2^{\perp} | q | 1^{\perp} ] [(P_{23}^{\perp})^2 - m^2 \frac{q \cdot P_{23}}{q \cdot P_2} + m^2]}$$

Subleading order:  $\left\langle g_1^- \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} g_2^+ \phi_3^{34} \phi_4^{34} \right\rangle_{\text{sym}}$ 

$$g_{1}^{-} \xrightarrow{\phi_{4}^{34} \phi_{3}^{34}} g_{2}^{+} + g_{1}^{-} \xrightarrow{\phi_{4}^{34} \phi_{3}^{34}} g_{2}^{+}$$

$$= \frac{m^2 \langle 1^{\perp} | q | 2^{\perp} ]}{\langle 2^{\perp} | q | 1^{\perp} ] (P_{23}^{\perp})^2} \times \left[ \frac{1}{\varepsilon} \left( \frac{m^2}{4 q \cdot p_1} + \frac{m^2}{4 q \cdot p_2} \right) - \frac{m^2 q \cdot P_{23}}{(P_{23}^{\perp})^2 q \cdot p_2} + O(\varepsilon) \right]$$

Finite sum of divergent diagrams, builds up  $p_2^{\perp} \rightarrow p_2$  in propagator!

### The 4-point amplitude $\langle W^- \overline{W}^+ \phi^{34} \phi^{34} \rangle$

$$\langle W^- \overline{W}^+ \phi^{34} \phi^{34} \rangle = -\frac{m^2 \langle 1^{\perp} | q | 2^{\perp} ]}{\langle 2^{\perp} | q | 1^{\perp} ] (P_{23}^2 + m^2)} = -\frac{m^2 \langle 1^{\perp} | q | 2^{\perp} ]}{\langle 2^{\perp} | q | 1^{\perp} ] [(P_{23}^{\perp})^2 - m^2 \frac{q \cdot P_{23}}{q \cdot P_2} + m^2]}$$

#### All orders in m

- Internal 4-point vertices  $\times$  build up '+m<sup>2</sup>' in propagator
- External 4-point vertices  $\times$  build up ' $p_2^{\perp} \rightarrow p_2$ ' in propagator

### The 4-point amplitude $\langle W^- \overline{W}^+ \phi^{34} \phi^{34} \rangle$

$$\langle W^- \overline{W}^+ \phi^{34} \phi^{34} \rangle = -\frac{m^2 \langle 1^{\perp} | q | 2^{\perp} ]}{\langle 2^{\perp} | q | 1^{\perp} ] (P_{23}^2 + m^2)} = -\frac{m^2 \langle 1^{\perp} | q | 2^{\perp} ]}{\langle 2^{\perp} | q | 1^{\perp} ] [(P_{23}^{\perp})^2 - m^2 \frac{q \cdot P_{23}}{q \cdot P_2} + m^2]}$$

#### All orders in m

- Internal 4-point vertices  $\times$  build up '+m<sup>2</sup>' in propagator
- External 4-point vertices  $\times$  build up ' $p_2^{\perp} \rightarrow p_2$ ' in propagator



22 / 29

< 1<sup>™</sup> >

NBI

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle = \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle_{sym}.$$

Non-trivial Checks

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle = \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle_{sym}.$$

#### Non-trivial Checks

• An all-*n* amplitude, to all orders in *m*:

$$\langle W_1^- \overline{W}_2^+ \phi_3^{34} \dots \phi_n^{34} \rangle =$$

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle = \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle_{sym}.$$

#### Non-trivial Checks

• An all-*n* amplitude, to all orders in *m*:

$$\langle W_1^- \overline{W}_2^+ \phi_3^{34} \dots \phi_n^{34} \rangle = \sum g_1^- \underbrace{\phi_n^{34}}_{\wedge \dots \wedge} \underbrace{\phi_4^{34}}_{\wedge \dots \wedge} \underbrace{\phi_3^{34}}_{\wedge \dots \wedge} g_2^+$$

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle = \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle_{sym}.$$

#### Non-trivial Checks

• An all-*n* amplitude, to all orders in *m*:

NBI Aug 29, 2011 23 / 29

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle = \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle_{sym}.$$

#### Non-trivial Checks

• An all-*n* amplitude, to all orders in *m*:

#### • Proof of finite soft limit, to all orders in *m*, for any amplitude!

NBI Aug 29, 2011

#### Generalizations of proposal

natural proposal for CB amplitudes with arbitrary masses.

breaking  $U(N) \rightarrow \prod_{k} U(M_{k}) \Rightarrow \langle \phi \rangle \sim v_{k} \Rightarrow m_{X} = v_{k_{1}} - v_{k_{2}}$ 

with particle X in bifundamental of  $U(M_{k_1}) \times U(M_{k_2})$ .

#### Generalizations of proposal

natural proposal for CB amplitudes with arbitrary masses.

breaking  $U(N) \rightarrow \prod_{k} U(M_{k}) \Rightarrow \langle \phi \rangle \sim v_{k} \Rightarrow m_{X} = v_{k_{1}} - v_{k_{2}}$ 

with particle X in bifundamental of  $U(M_{k_1}) \times U(M_{k_2})$ .



#### Generalizations of proposal

natural proposal for CB amplitudes with arbitrary masses.

breaking  $U(N) \rightarrow \prod_{k} U(M_{k}) \Rightarrow \langle \phi \rangle \sim v_{k} \Rightarrow m_{X} = v_{k_{1}} - v_{k_{2}}$ 

with particle X in bifundamental of  $U(M_{k_1}) \times U(M_{k_2})$ .

Double-line notation useful:

$$n \underset{1}{\underbrace{k_n}}$$

$$\langle X_1 X_2 \dots X_n \rangle$$

$$= \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \sum_{s_1 + \dots + s_n = s}^{\langle} \langle Y_1 \underbrace{\phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\mathrm{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\mathrm{vev}}}_{s_1 \text{ times}} Y_2 \underbrace{\phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\mathrm{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\mathrm{vev}}}_{s_2 \text{ times}} Y_3 \dots Y_n \underbrace{\phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\mathrm{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\mathrm{vev}}}_{s_n \text{ times}} \rangle_{\mathrm{sym}}.$$

#### Generalizations of proposal

natural proposal for CB amplitudes with arbitrary masses.

breaking  $U(N) \rightarrow \prod_{k} U(M_{k}) \Rightarrow \langle \phi \rangle \sim v_{k} \Rightarrow m_{X} = v_{k_{1}} - v_{k_{2}}$ 

with particle X in bifundamental of  $U(M_{k_1}) \times U(M_{k_2})$ .

Double-line notation useful:

۲

$$n \underset{1}{\overbrace{k_1}} k_1$$

$$\langle X_1 X_2 \dots X_n \rangle$$

$$= \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \sum_{s_1 + \dots + s_n = s} \langle Y_1 \underbrace{\phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}}}_{s_1 \text{ times}} Y_2 \underbrace{\phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}}}_{s_2 \text{ times}} Y_3 \dots Y_n \underbrace{\phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}}}_{s_n \text{ times}} \rangle_{\text{sym}}.$$
similar proposal for loop integrand (SUSY important!)

NBI



#### 2 Coulomb-branch S-matrix from massless amplitudes

3 Tests of Proposal

4 A CSW-like expansion on the Coulomb branch

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle = \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle_{sym}.$$

- infinite sum over massless amplitudes, complicated symmetrization
- in simple examples: infinite sum ⇒ single diagram with massive propagators:

$$\langle W_1^- \overline{W}_2^+ \phi_3^{34} \dots \phi_n^{34} \rangle = g_1^- \underbrace{\downarrow}_{n}^{\phi_1^{34}} \dots \underbrace{\downarrow}_{n}^{\phi_2^{34}} g_2^+$$

NBI

Aug 29, 2011

26 / 29

Michael Kiermaier (Princeton University) A massive S-matrix from massless amplitudes

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle = \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle_{sym}.$$

- infinite sum over massless amplitudes, complicated symmetrization
- in simple examples: infinite sum ⇒ single diagram with massive propagators:

$$\langle W_1^- \overline{W}_2^+ \phi_3^{34} \dots \phi_n^{34} \rangle = g_1^- \downarrow \dots \downarrow g_2^+$$

• is this always possible? what are the massive Feynman rules?

Aug 29, 2011 26 / 29

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle = \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle_{sym}.$$

- infinite sum over massless amplitudes, complicated symmetrization
- in simple examples: infinite sum ⇒ single diagram with massive propagators:

$$\langle W_1^- \overline{W}_2^+ \phi_3^{34} \dots \phi_n^{34} \rangle = g_1^- + \dots + g_2^{34} + g_2^{34}$$

is this always possible? what are the massive Feynman rules?
 ⇒ on-shell derivation of Feynman rules in the broken phase?

NBI Aug 29, 2011

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle = \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle_{sym}.$$

#### Resummation $\Rightarrow$ Massive CSW-like rules:

• massive scalar propagators:  $\dots = \frac{1}{P_i^2 + m_i^2}, \quad m_I = \sum_{i \in I} m_i.$ 

• MHV vertex: 
$$W_n^+ \cdots W_3^+ = \frac{\langle 1^{\perp} 2^{\perp} \rangle^4}{\langle 1^{\perp} 2^{\perp} \rangle \cdots \langle n^{\perp} 1^{\perp} \rangle}$$
.

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle = \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle_{sym}.$$

#### Resummation $\Rightarrow$ Massive CSW-like rules:

• massive scalar propagators:  $\dots = \frac{1}{P_i^2 + m_i^2}, \quad m_I = \sum_{i \in I} m_i$ .

• MHV vertex: 
$$W_n^+ \cdots W_3^+ = \frac{\langle 1^{\perp} 2^{\perp} \rangle^4}{\langle 1^{\perp} 2^{\perp} \rangle \cdots \langle n^{\perp} 1^{\perp} \rangle}$$
.

• UHV vertex: 
$$W_n^{\dagger} \xrightarrow{W_n^{\dagger}} W_2^{\dagger} = \kappa^2 \frac{\langle q^{\perp} 1^{\perp} \rangle^4}{\langle 1^{\perp} 2^{\perp} \rangle \cdots \langle n^{\perp} 1^{\perp} \rangle}, \quad \kappa = \sum_i \frac{m_i \langle 1^{\perp} i^{\perp} \rangle}{\langle 1^{\perp} q \rangle \langle i^{\perp} q \rangle}.$$

Michael Kiermaier (Princeton University) A massive S-matrix from massless amplitudes
#### Convenient representation for massless amplitudes

$$\langle W_1 \overline{W}_2 \dots \rangle = \lim_{\varepsilon \to 0} \sum_{s=0}^{\infty} \langle g_1 \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} \dots \phi_{\varepsilon q}^{\text{vev}} g_2 \dots \rangle_{sym}.$$

#### Resummation $\Rightarrow$ Massive CSW-like rules:

• massive scalar propagators:  $\dots = \frac{1}{P_i^2 + m_i^2}, \quad m_I = \sum_{i \in I} m_i.$ 

• MHV vertex: 
$$W_n^+ \cdots W_3^+ = \frac{\langle 1^{\perp} 2^{\perp} \rangle^4}{\langle 1^{\perp} 2^{\perp} \rangle \cdots \langle n^{\perp} 1^{\perp} \rangle}$$
.

• UHV vertex: 
$$\frac{W_n^+}{W_1^-} \underbrace{W_3^+}_{W_2^+} = K^2 \frac{\langle q^{\perp} 1^{\perp} \rangle^4}{\langle 1^{\perp} 2^{\perp} \rangle \cdots \langle n^{\perp} 1^{\perp} \rangle}, \quad K = \sum_i \frac{m_i \langle 1^{\perp} i^{\perp} \rangle}{\langle 1^{\perp} q \rangle \langle i^{\perp} q \rangle}.$$
$$W_1^+ \cdots W_1^+$$

• UHV×MHV vertex:  $W_1 \longrightarrow W_2^{34} = K \frac{(q+1+)^2(1+2+)^2}{(1+2+)\cdots(n+1+)}$ .

Michael Kiermaier (Princeton University) A massive S-matrix from massless amplitudes

26 / 29

# A simple example: $\langle W_1^- \overline{W}_2^+ \phi_3^{34} \dots \phi_n^{34} \rangle$

#### A simple example: $\langle W_1^- \overline{W}_2^+ \phi_3^{34} \dots \phi_n^{34} \rangle$



A non-trivial example:  $\langle W^- \overline{W}^+ g^+ \dots g^+ \rangle$ 



• discouraging at first sight: many diagrams!

A non-trivial example:  $\langle W^- \overline{W}^+ g^+ \dots g^+ \rangle$ 

$$W_{1}^{-} \xrightarrow{g_{n}^{+} g_{3}^{+}} W_{2}^{+} + \sum_{i=3}^{n-1} W_{1}^{-} \xrightarrow{g_{n}^{+} g_{i+1}^{+} g_{i}^{+} g_{3}^{+}} W_{2}^{+} + \dots$$

- discouraging at first sight: many diagrams!
- BUT: sum of diagrams can be factorized into one simple term:

$$\frac{m^2 \langle q 1^{\perp} \rangle^2}{\langle q 2^{\perp} \rangle^2 \langle 2^{\perp} 3 \rangle \langle 34 \rangle \cdots \langle n1^{\perp} \rangle} \times \langle 2^{\perp} | \prod_{j=3}^{n-1} \left[ 1 - \frac{m^2 |P_J\rangle \langle j, j+1\rangle \langle P_J|}{(P_J^2 + m^2) \langle P_J, j\rangle \langle j+1, P_J \rangle} \right] | 1^{\perp} \rangle.$$

27 / 29

A non-trivial example:  $\langle W^- \overline{W}^+ g^+ \dots g^+ \rangle$ 

$$W_{1}^{-} \xrightarrow{g_{n}^{+}} \overline{W}_{2}^{+} + \sum_{i=3}^{n-1} W_{1}^{-} \xrightarrow{g_{n}^{+}} \overline{y}_{i+1}^{+} g_{j}^{+} g_{3}^{+} + \dots$$

- discouraging at first sight: many diagrams!
- BUT: sum of diagrams can be factorized into one simple term:

$$\frac{m^2 \langle q1^{\perp} \rangle^2}{\langle q2^{\perp} \rangle^2 \langle 2^{\perp} 3 \rangle \langle 34 \rangle \cdots \langle n1^{\perp} \rangle} \times \langle 2^{\perp} \big| \prod_{j=3}^{n-1} \bigg[ 1 - \frac{m^2 |P_J\rangle \langle j, j+1\rangle \langle P_J|}{(P_J^2 + m^2) \langle P_J, j\rangle \langle j+1, P_J \rangle} \bigg] |1^{\perp} \rangle.$$

• should be compared to BCFW form of same amplitude:

$$-\frac{m^2\langle q\,1^{\perp}\rangle^2}{\langle q\,2^{\perp}\rangle^2\,\langle 34\rangle\langle 45\rangle\cdots\langle n-1,\,n\rangle(P_{n1}^2+m^2)}\times \big[3\big|\prod_{j=3}^{n-2}\Big[1+\frac{P_J|j+1\rangle[j+1|}{P_J^2+m^2}\Big]\big|n\big]\,.$$

• similar complexity, but no recursion to solve!

29

#### Summary

• precise proposal for

massive on-shell amplitude 
$$= \sum$$
 massless on-shell amplitudes

э

- 一司

#### Summary

• precise proposal for

massive on-shell amplitude 
$$\ = \ \sum$$
 massless on-shell amplitudes  $|$ 

• on-shell description of spontaneous symmetry breaking

#### Summary

precise proposal for

massive on-shell amplitude  $= \sum massless on-shell amplitudes |$ .

- on-shell description of spontaneous symmetry breaking
- checked in examples
- cancelation of soft-divergences proven in general

#### Summary

precise proposal for

massive on-shell amplitude  $= \sum \text{massless on-shell amplitudes}$ .

- on-shell description of spontaneous symmetry breaking
- checked in examples
- cancelation of soft-divergences proven in general
- at tree-level: specific symmetry-breaking pattern and SUSY irrelevant

#### Summary

precise proposal for

massive on-shell amplitude  $= \sum \text{massless on-shell amplitudes}$ .

- on-shell description of spontaneous symmetry breaking
- checked in examples
- cancelation of soft-divergences proven in general
- at tree-level: specific symmetry-breaking pattern and SUSY irrelevant
- with SUSY  $\Rightarrow$  proposal for loop integrand

#### Summary

precise proposal for

massive on-shell amplitude  $= \sum \text{massless on-shell amplitudes}$ .

- on-shell description of spontaneous symmetry breaking
- checked in examples
- cancelation of soft-divergences proven in general
- at tree-level: specific symmetry-breaking pattern and SUSY irrelevant
- with SUSY  $\Rightarrow$  proposal for loop integrand
- infinte sum over diagrams can be resummed
  ⇒ CSW-like expansion for Coulomb-branch amplitudes

#### Open problems

• prove proposal!

#### Open problems

- prove proposal!
- applied proposal to particular massless amplitude representation:

 $\text{massless CSW} \ \longrightarrow \ \boxed{\textit{proposal}} \ \stackrel{\text{resum}}{\longrightarrow} \ \text{massive CSW-like expansion} \, .$ 

Use proposal to get other convenient expressions for CB amplitudes?

other massless representations  $\longrightarrow$  proposal  $\stackrel{\text{resum?}}{\longrightarrow}$  ???.

For example, to make 6d dual conformal invariance manifest?

#### Open problems

- prove proposal!
- applied proposal to particular massless amplitude representation:

massless CSW  $\longrightarrow$  *proposal*  $\xrightarrow{\text{resum}}$  massive CSW-like expansion .

Use proposal to get other convenient expressions for CB amplitudes?

other massless representations  $\longrightarrow$  proposal  $\xrightarrow{\text{resum?}}$  ???.

For example, to make 6*d* dual conformal invariance manifest?

apply CSW-like expansion at tree and loop level

#### Open problems

- prove proposal!
- applied proposal to particular massless amplitude representation:

 $\text{massless CSW} \ \longrightarrow \ \boxed{\textit{proposal}} \ \stackrel{\text{resum}}{\longrightarrow} \ \text{massive CSW-like expansion} \, .$ 

Use proposal to get other convenient expressions for CB amplitudes?

other massless representations  $\longrightarrow$  proposal  $\stackrel{\text{resum?}}{\longrightarrow}$  ???.

For example, to make 6d dual conformal invariance manifest?

- apply CSW-like expansion at tree and loop level
- massive amplitudes useful for rational terms in QCD [Badger, Boels]